

**Regional Partnership For
Decentralization and Local Governance
In the Americas**

**Quarterly Report XV
April 1-June 30, 2002**

Prepared for The U.S. Agency for International Development
Bureau for Latin America and the Caribbean
Office of Regional and Sustainable Development

July 12, 2002

International City/County Management Association

Cooperative Agreement Award No. LAG-A-00-98-00060-00

**Regional Partnership For
Decentralization and Local Governance
In the Americas**

USAID Quarterly Report XIV

April 1 to June 30, 2002

Table of Contents

1. Introduction.....	3
2. Major Accomplishments this Quarter	
Component 1: Donor Consultation	3
Component 2: Information Exchange and Networking.....	4
Component 3: Local Government Training.....	8
3. Challenges/Issues of Concern Affecting Implementation and Actions Taken	8
4. Projected Activities for the Next Quarter	9

Annexes:

Annex 1:	Summary of Virtual Conference on Poverty Alleviation (February 11-22, 2002)
Annex 2:	Electronic Newsletters
	1) LAC Quarterly Newsletter (May 2, 2002)
	2) LAC Forum E-Newsletter on Performance Measurement (May 31, 2002)
Annex 3:	Notes of Presentation by Dr. Subash Bhatnagar
	Enabling E-Government in Developing Countries: ICTs Bringing Transparency
Annex 4:	Local E-Governance: A Challenge and an Opportunity
	Program Agenda, Guadalajara, Mexico, June 22, 2002
Annex 5:	Draft Minutes of Capacity and Institution Building Platform of IULA, Guadalajara, Mexico, June 23, 2002
Annex 6:	E-Learning: An Option for Local Government Training in Latin America and the Caribbean
Annex 7:	Quarterly Financial Summary

I. Introduction

The *Regional Partnership for Decentralization and Local Governance* will serve as a vehicle with which to implement the Summit of the Americas Plan of Action II, Strengthening Municipal and Regional Administrations. The *Partnership* will contribute to the LAC Regional Sustainable Development Office's Strategic Objective #5 (SO5): "Reinforcement of regional trends that deepen democracy in Latin America and the Caribbean." The *Partnership* will also contribute to LAC's Intermediate Result #2 (IR2): "Strengthened regional mechanisms to improve public sector legitimacy."

II. Major Accomplishments

Component 1: Donor Consultation

The international donor community will establish a Donor Consultative Group (DCG) for Decentralization and Local Governance in Latin America and the Caribbean. ICMA will serve as the DCG Executive Secretariat.

Activities and Accomplishments this Quarter:

Update of Forum Web site

During this quarter, the Secretariat updated the contact information for all of the representatives of the donors included in the forum directory; updated and continued to add programs and projects to the Programs section; and reviewed and added records to the library section.

ICMA brought on board a summer intern, Meg Moga, who is a graduate student at the University of Texas at Austin in Public Affairs and Latin American Studies. Meg will be conducting research for the Programs Section of the LAC Forum site as well as the issue newsletters.

Virtual discussion on national strategies for poverty reduction in Latin America and the Caribbean.

Pursuant to the list serve discussion, which took place during the first quarter of this year (Feb. 11-22), FEMICA has provided ICMA with a summary of the proceedings. The summary is included in Annex 1.

Case Studies: Bolivia and Nicaragua

Final drafts of the case studies were presented to ICMA at the end of June for review. The drafts will be finalized during the next quarter and a roundtable meeting in Washington, D.C. will be organized with key Forum representatives from member organizations such as the World Bank, Inter-American Development Bank, GTZ (if

available) and others to validate the reports and discuss their dissemination. The Secretariat will suggest that regional meetings in Bolivia and Nicaragua be held to share with high-level national government officials and the donor community the lessons-learned from each experience.

GW Workgroup on Poverty Alleviation

The GW Workgroup completed and presented its report on poverty alleviation policies in LAC during this quarter. A hard copy of this report is available at ICMA and will be made available on-line at: www.lacforum.org. The Executive Summary from the report will be distributed at the upcoming Woodrow Wilson Center Forum on “Reducing Poverty and Strengthening Growth: The Urban Perspective.” The event is scheduled for July 25 and 26.

Meeting with GTZ on Regional Program for Central and South America

On April 9, ICMA met with three representatives of the VNG – Annette Bähring (Principal Advisor, Local Development Project), Jorg Haas (Director, GTZ/Chile) and Eduardo Buller (GTZ/Nicaragua) at the initiative of the GTZ to discuss their upcoming regional program for Central and South America (Proyecto de Gestión del Conocimiento para la Descentralización y el Desarrollo en Latinoamérica). This program (still at the proposal stages) came out of the regional event held in Costa Rica in May 2000 that was co-sponsored by the Forum and the GTZ. The event, which included as participants representatives of bilateral and multilateral donor agencies, as well as local government officials and association representatives, highlighted the need for greater coordination and information-sharing in the Region. Many of the Forum activities of the past two years, such as the creation of the Programs Section on the Web site, the virtual discussions and the study on donor collaboration in Nicaragua and Bolivia, were in direct response to the suggestions of participants at the event in May 2000. At the April 9 meeting, the GTZ renewed its commitment to the Forum and promised closer collaboration in sharing information and providing input to the Technical Secretariat.

Component 2: Information Exchange and Networking

ICMA will work with regional entities to establish sustainable mechanisms for the exchange of information and experience between and among regional organizations, municipal associations and local governments, and NGOs throughout the Americas.

Activities and Accomplishments this Quarter

Forum Newsletter

A quarterly newsletter and an issue-based newsletter were distributed this quarter and are included in Annex 2. The quarterly newsletter described Forum Activities, such as the World Bank Institute Event on E-Learning, and featured upcoming events either sponsored by the Forum or of interest to its members. The issue-based newsletter highlighted local government performance measurement activities undertaken by Forum members.

Meeting with Dot.Com

On April 4, ICMA met with representatives of the USAID-funded Dot.Com Activity to receive an update on the meeting of the ICA (Institute for Connectivity in the Americas) in Brazil and discuss collaboration between ICA and Dot.Com. Another objective of the meeting was to provide information to the group about an e-government event in Guadalajara, Mexico that occurred at the end of June (see description below). The Forum Secretariat has sought to involve Dot.Com representatives in Forum events, in particular those where national and regional municipal associations are in attendance, to ensure that local government associations are taken into account as potential partners in activities implemented by this USAID-funded activity.

USAID Development Dialogue: Enabling E-Government in Developing Countries: ICTs Bringing Transparency

On May 2, 2002, ICMA representatives attended a presentation by Professor Subhash Bhatnagar. Dr. Bhatnagar, who is on leave from the Indian Institute of Management in Ahmedabad, is currently with the World Bank working on an assignment to mainstream E-government applications into the activities of the Bank. For more information on the Bank's E-government initiatives and the work of Dr. Bhatnagar, please consult the following URL: <http://www.worldbank.org/publicsector/egov>. Dr. Bhatnagar discussed successful examples of E-government in developing countries, such as the land record computerization program in Bhoomi, Karnataka, India. He outlined the different levels of transparency with regards to E-government and critical success factors for E-government programs, which he identified as the following:

- ✓ Clearly identified goals
- ✓ Significant reengineering
- ✓ Start small and build up
- ✓ Outsource design and development
- ✓ Train employees and citizens
- ✓ Provide strong leadership

E-government is an area that the donors have expressed an interest in receiving information about via the Forum. A copy of Dr. Bhatnagar's presentation is included in Annex 3 and has also been posted on the Forum site.

Local E-Governance: A Challenge and an Opportunity Guadalajara, Mexico, June 22, 2002

IULA and the United Towns Organization (UTO) organized a special event at the World Executive Committee Meeting on local E-governance to highlight the experiences of local governments worldwide in implementing E-government solutions in three areas: changing the relations between local governments and citizens; new service provision;

and changing government structures. A copy of the Agenda for the event is included in Annex 4.

ICMA, invited a representative from the World Bank, Jacqueline Dubow (Program Coordinator, InfoDev: Global Information and Communication Technologies) to attend for the Forum and present at the event. At ICMA's invitation, Noreene Janus, USAID Technology Advisor, also attended the event. In addition, both attended the Capacity and Institution Building (CIB) Platform Meeting on Sunday, June 23.

Among the issues discussed at the CIB Platform meeting included progress on the creation of a database (PIMEX) to provide information to municipalities to facilitate exchanges of municipal experts in key areas of local governance; a IULA/FLACMA initiative funded by Cities Alliance to develop a human poverty index; a study undertaken by the Dutch Municipal Association (VNG) to assess whether bilateral international aid funds in selected countries (Sweden, UK and Canada, among others) are being equitably channeled to local governments (vs. NGOs) for municipal strengthening activities; and the importance of closer collaboration between the International Daughter Company Network of IULA and the CIB Platform. Details of the discussions are included in the draft minutes from the meeting in Annex 5.

As part of the Forum presentation, ICMA had invited a speaker from the Bertelsmann Foundation in Germany to present on a recently completed study on *E-Government: Connecting Efficient Administration and Responsive Democracy*. Unfortunately, the speaker cancelled at the last minute and it was agreed that ICMA would organize an on-line discussion on the topic in the upcoming weeks focusing on indicators for measuring the impact of technology on municipalities. The discussion would be held through the list serve on E-governance established by FEMICA to provide input to the Guadalajara Event, and invitees would include members of international cooperation agencies involved in implementing technology projects at the local government level.

Cities Alliance Grant for development of City Development Strategies (CDS) Learning Platform

The Cities Alliance Group has provided ICMA with start-up funding to prepare for the development of a website and interactive electronic training tool that achieves the following:

- allows cities to share successful development projects (both those derived from CDS and those that reflect other types of community planning);
- organizes information in a way that enables cities to find cases which are most useful to their particular needs;
- organizes information in a way that assists cities incorporate processes that are inclusive and pro-poor; and
- demonstrates the links between development and effective management practices, thus using limited resources more efficiently.

In order to develop the site, ICMA will draw input from its existing networks, one of which is the Forum. In addition to its focus as an organization dedicated to improving local governments worldwide, ICMA's experience as the Technical and Executive Secretariat of the Forum (some of whose members are also members of Cities Alliance), and in particular the development of the LAC Forum web site, was a key factor in the selection of ICMA as the recipient of the grant from Cities Alliance.

ICMA will send out a survey to selected local governments in the next quarter to assess what officials would like to see on the Web site. ICMA will forward the survey to IULA/FLACMA and FEMICA for their input. By October, ICMA will have designed the information framework and data collection tools, conducted focus groups with selected cities and associations and produced screen shots of the site. Should the Consultative Group approve the results of Phase I, ICMA will be provided with a grant to implement Phase II, which would consist of gathering the input for the site from the cities that have implemented strategic plans either with their own resources or through donor funding, in order to fulfill the objectives listed above. ICMA will consult with the Forum members in Phase II to solicit their contributions to the Web site.

Component 3: Local Government Training

ICMA will provide leadership in collaboration with U.S. and Latin American and Caribbean universities, regional and national associations, and municipal support NGOs in designing and implementing practical, affordable, needs-driven and results-oriented local government training programs in Latin America and the Caribbean.

Activities and Accomplishments this Quarter

E-Learning Paper

During this quarter the E-Learning paper was completed and distributed at the Guadalajara E-Governance Event. A copy is included in Annex 6. ICMA will make an electronic copy available to Forum members. The Task Force will be formed during the next quarter to comment on the paper and to begin developing a roadmap for donor organizations to follow when implementing E-learning activities. ICMA has identified an individual to provide guidance to the Forum Secretariat on selecting Task Force members and leading the discussion. ICMA expects to contract the consultant during the next quarter.

III. Challenges/Remedial Actions Taken

The draft of the program description and budget was not approved this quarter. Because of the ever-changing nature of its activities under this Agreement, ICMA will be submitting a revised program description during the next quarter which will be formally submitted to the Regional Contracts Office for their approval.

IV. Projected Activities

Component 1: Donor Consultation

- The Secretariat will finalize and distribute the two case studies on donor cooperation in technical assistance and training activities in Bolivia and Nicaragua. In addition, the Secretariat will organize a roundtable discussion with key members of donor institutions in Washington, D.C. to discuss the findings and recommend next steps for broad dissemination of the studies.

Component 2: Information Exchange and Networking

- The Secretariat will continue to update and add records to the Programs and Library sections of the Web site
- ICMA will send out two E-newsletters to all Forum members during this quarter -- a thematic newsletter on local economic development, and a quarterly newsletter on news and activities of the Forum.
- ICMA will hold an on-line discussion through the FEMICA list serve on E-governance. The discussion will focus on indicators for measuring the impact of E-government initiatives at the municipal level.

Component 3: Local Government Training

- The Secretariat will hire a consultant to provide guidance on the selection of members of the E-Learning Task Force and to lead the discussion based on the findings of the E-Learning paper.

**Annex 1: Summary of Virtual Conference on Poverty
Alleviation (February 11-22, 2002)**



**Federación de Municipios del Istmo Centroamericano
-FEMICA-
Y
Foro Internacional de Cooperación de Gobiernos locales en
América Latina y el Caribe -FORUM-**

Resumen de la CONFERENCIA

Virtual

“Estrategias Nacionales de Reducción de la Pobreza”

Realizada del 11 al 22 de febrero de 2002

(Actividad de seguimiento)

*VIII Reunión de la Red Centroamericana por la Descentralización y el Fortalecimiento Municipal
“Los Municipios y el Combate a la Pobreza en Centroamérica” realizada el 15 y 16 de noviembre
de 2001.*

INTRODUCCIÓN

Dentro del marco de discusión de la VIII Reunión de la Red Centroamericana por la Descentralización y el Fortalecimiento Municipal, *"Los Municipios y el Combate a la Pobreza en Centroamérica"*, realizado en la ciudad de La Antigua Guatemala, Guatemala, los días 15 y 16 de noviembre 2001, se concibió la necesidad de discutir y profundizar este tema a través de la utilización de sistemas de comunicación virtual, con el propósito de enriquecer y dar continuidad a los aportes e iniciativas expresadas por los participantes, relacionados con proyectos de reducción de la pobreza.

De esta cuenta, FEMICA con el apoyo logístico de la Secretaria Técnica del Forum Latinoamericano organizó la primera Conferencia Virtual, bajo la temática "Estrategias Nacionales de Reducción de la Pobreza", la cual se realizó del 11 al 22 de febrero de 2002.

Los resultados y aportes de la discusión han sido resumidos y compilados en este documento para su mejor apreciación y análisis.

La conducción y moderación de la conferencia contó con la valiosa participación de la Sra. Verónica Silva, Sub-directora de Gestión de Programas de FOSIS, Chile, y en calidad de panelistas participaron la Sra. Evelyn Jacir de Lovo, Ministra de Educación de El Salvador; Sr. Jorge Ramón Hernández Alcerro, Secretario de Gobernación y Justicia de Honduras; Sra. Priscilla Phelps, Especialista Municipal del Banco Interamericano de Desarrollo -BID- y el Sr. Miguel Von Hoegen, Secretario General de Planificación Económica (SEGEPLAN) en Guatemala, a quienes FEMICA desea patentizar su agradecimiento por el apoyo y conocimientos proporcionados durante el desarrollo de la conferencia.

DESARROLLO DE LA CONFERENCIA VIRTUAL

Palabras de Bienvenida

Sra. Verónica Silva V.
Moderadora.

Bienvenidos a la conferencia virtual para desarrollar el panel "*Estrategias Nacionales de Reducción de la Pobreza*". Con el fin de poder dar inicio a la discusión a través de este medio electrónico, les agradecería a los panelistas participantes responder a este primer mensaje, informando si están listos para iniciar nuestros contactos.

Bienvenidos a todos los que se integran a este intercambio virtual. Para comenzar con nuestro intercambio, quisiera sugerir a los panelistas que nos comenten sus principales ideas, quisiera sugerirles a los panelistas que nos comenten sus principales ideas, de acuerdo a sus experiencias, en torno a ¿cuáles creen que son los factores o elementos claves a tomar en cuenta por los países para la formulación de una estrategia nacional de superación de la pobreza?.

Intervención de Aarón Drayer

adrayer@chemonics.net

Yo opinaría que uno de los elementos más importantes es un componente municipal (en cualquier programa), que promueva la participación popular en la toma de decisiones.

Intervención de Maribel Suazo

Maribelsuazo4@yahoo.com

Considero que entre los factores sociales y económicos hay que buscar un equilibrio, haciendo una caracterización de lo prioritario, es así como podemos hablar de impulsar un proceso de desarrollo local con participación ciudadana, orientado hacia el tejido productivo.

Podemos hablar del aspecto educativo de manera integral orientado hacia lo productivo.

Intervención del administrador de participantes

pobreza@reduccionpobrezatheforum.org

Estimados participantes:

Tenemos el agrado de informarles de que el Embajador Representante Permanente de Guatemala ante las Naciones Unidas, Dr. Rosenthal, participará en nuestra discusión. El Dr. Rosenthal fue Secretario Ejecutivo para América Latina y el Caribe de la CEPAL.

Intervención de Verónica Silva V.

Moderadora.

Agradecemos la valiosa participación del Sr. G. Rosenthal, representante permanente de Guatemala ante Naciones Unidas, quien se ha incorporado al panel y esperamos sus comentarios y sugerencias.

Invitamos igualmente a todos y todas que estén conectados a intercambiar ideas acerca de los factores que es necesario tener en cuenta en la formulación de una estrategia nacional de superación de la pobreza.

Intervención de Juan Alberto González

Universidad de San Carlos de Guatemala
gonzalez@concyt.gob.gt

Principales ideas, de acuerdo a sus experiencias. ¿cuáles creen que son los factores o elementos claves a tomar en consideración por los países para la formulación de una estrategia nacional de superación de la pobreza.?

1. Identificar que elementos de la pobreza son los determinantes para encontrar sus causas y proponer soluciones.
2. Desarrollar un programa por fases que se retro-alimente, partiendo de un sistema operativo que tenga clara la cantidad de fondos disponibles, los mecanismos de toma de decisión los cuales tienen que ser participativos y bajo el liderazgo de los pobres o de los representantes de sus organizaciones y gobiernos locales.

Intervención de Erick Coyoy

SEGEPLAN de Guatemala.

ecoyoy@segeplan.gob.gt

Por considerarlo de importancia, me permito enviar el discurso de la Primera Vicepresidenta de Costa Rica en la inauguración de la VIII Reunión de la Red Centroamericana por la Descentralización y el Fortalecimiento Municipal, que tuvo como enfoque principal el papel de los municipios en la reducción de la pobreza.

Intervención de Reynaldo Castro Melgarejo.

reynaldocastromelgarejo@hotmail.com

En mi experiencia y mi convicción, la lucha en contra de la pobreza extrema, con el objetivo de erradicarla o reducirla, está amarrada al combate PREVENTIVO de la corrupción. Sin ello es muy difícil lograr algo.

La experiencia histórica en todos nuestros países, nos demuestra diversos fracasos, por falta de verdaderos compromisos con las ciudadanas y ciudadanos de cada nación. Es por ello que creo positivo y alentador para tener verdaderos elementos de valoración, para un mejor diseño de políticas públicas con estrategias viables y contundentes en la PREVENCIÓN para combatir ambos flagelos subrayados.

Las verdaderas causas que han originado y seguirán provocándola, son también, los enemigos a vencer en la Función Pública: la discrecionalidad, la corrupción, la larga cadena de complicidades, la omisión, la dispersión, la evasión fiscal y la impunidad, con el Programa que propongo para impulsar la Nueva Cultura de la Transparencia en la Función Pública, podremos generar una nueva concepción y obligación del manejo de los dineros del pueblo.

Tenemos que promover las reformas estructurales y constitucionales necesarias para hacer para siempre preventiva la lucha contra la pobreza extrema y la corrupción, sé que es difícil, pero es mejor plantearnos metas serias y altas que nos lleven a posibles soluciones para siempre y tomar como referencia los fracasos históricos por que la gradualidad y el lento proceso de los cambios, favorecieron las condiciones para reafirmar la corrupción y sus secuelas de pobreza y miseria, que hoy queremos superar.

Demos certeza y luchemos por que en nuestros países logremos permanente y crecientemente mayor rentabilidad social en el uso de los recursos públicos sean de origen nacional o extranjero.

Luchemos porque en nuestros pueblos, sean activos sociales, los concejos ciudadanos de concertación, la rendición de cuentas, la corresponsabilidad entre

sociedad y gobierno, y la transparencia en el origen y destino de los recursos públicos desde los municipios para consolidar la gobernabilidad democrática.

Intervención de Rafael Guido Béjar

Ministerio de Educación de El Salvador
Rafael.guido@mined.gob.sv

En nombre de la señora Ministra de Educación me permito enviar la respuesta a la primera interrogante de este Foro Virtual. ¿Cuáles son los factores o elementos claves a tomar en cuenta por los países para la formulación de una estrategia nacional de superación de la pobreza?

En primer lugar debe pensarse en quiénes son los sostenedores, organizadores y articuladores de una estrategia nacional para superar la pobreza, es decir, quiénes deben ser los principales actores políticos y sociales que pueden elaborar consensuadamente los principios básicos y los términos para la continuidad de dicha estrategia más allá de las administraciones en alternancia. Estos deben participar en las distintas fases de elaboración de esta estrategia para asegurar los márgenes de éxito.

El respaldo ciudadano y político debe llevar a una polémica abierta sobre la pobreza y sobre las metodologías más apropiadas para captar la naturaleza, la dimensión y las características más importantes del fenómeno social de la pobreza. Las metodologías son una forma determinada de aproximación a la medición del hecho y son parte del problema, por lo que hay que discutir públicamente las ventajas y desventajas de seleccionar una de ellas o de articularlas.

Debe conocerse con profundidad la dinámica de la población y de la economía, lo mismo que las relaciones de la pobreza con distintas variables de la desigualdad (ingreso, acceso a la educación, salud, bienes públicos, etc.), para pensar en proyecciones y estimaciones sobre el futuro que debe basarse en las más amplias preguntas posibles, no por razones académicas únicamente sino por supervivencia.

Intervención de Verónica Silva V.

Moderadora

Sugiero considerar de manera especial los aportes que hiciera llegar el Sr. Rafael Guido Béjar, en representación de la Sra. Ministra de Educación de El Salvador y los invito a proseguir complementando la siguiente pregunta ¿cuáles son los principales obstáculos que tienen los países para la formulación e implementación de una estrategia nacional de superación de la pobreza?.

Intervención de Erick Coyoy

SEGEPLAN de Guatemala

ecoyoy@segeplan.gob.gt

Acerca de los principales obstáculos con los que se encuentran los países para la formulación e implementación de una estrategia nacional de superación de la pobreza, considero que la Democracia es uno de ellos.

El fortalecimiento del sistema democrático es vital para garantizar la sostenibilidad de las políticas públicas a través de diferentes administraciones gubernamentales. Al respecto, me permito adjuntar el texto del mensaje pronunciado por José Saramago en la clausura del Foro Mundial Social reunidos en Porto Alegre, Brasil, el año anterior.

Intervención de Rafael Ernesto Góchez

Ciudadano salvadoreño

regoches@hotmail.com

Estimados/as participantes del Primer Foro Virtual:

En primer lugar, quiero felicitarles por esta iniciativa y desearles éxitos.

Gobernar en tiempos difíciles es una tarea para malabaristas. Ya que es fácil caer en medidas cortoplacistas y abandonar los cambios requeridos en política de desarrollo. Y como si esto fuera poco, cuando los gobernantes de turno miran el reloj, se percatan que el tiempo y la dinámica electoral han empezado a condicionar la toma de decisiones.

En El Salvador, el tema del combate a la pobreza a través del desarrollo local no ha sido parte integrante de los planes de trabajo del gabinete económico. A lo sumo, lo han tenido en cuenta los miembros del gabinete social. El enfoque economista se ha concentrado hacia la apertura externa (tratados de libre comercio), descuidándose la integración humana y territorial (apertura interna), prueba de ello es que la brecha entre el gran San Salvador y el resto del país, sigue aumentando.

Dado que el desarrollo local ha sido uno de los pocos temas que la oposición política ha logrado promover y manejar con cierta habilidad, ha generado una reacción "ideológica" por parte de las esferas del poder central. Muchos líderes empresariales y gubernamentales piensan que el desarrollo local es una bandera de la oposición, cuando en realidad la localización es una ola mundial al igual que la globalización. Es decir, globalización y localización son los dos rieles del desarrollo al inicio del siglo XXI.

Por ello, me gustaría preguntarles a los distinguidos panelistas lo siguiente:

- Si no se adopta como estrategia: el combate a la pobreza a través del desarrollo local, ¿qué otra opción o enfoque piensan que se presentará en las próximas ofertas electorales?
- Si no hubiera otra opción, ¿en qué piensan que se van a diferenciar los distintos programas (ofertas) electorales de los partidos políticos?
- La ciudadanía le cree cada vez menos a los políticos. El grado de abstencionismo es del 60%, por lo que, ¿cómo se le va a invitar a la gente a participar sin avances en la descentralización y la auditoría social?

Intervención del Sr. Tom Hawk

FISDEL de El Salvador

thawk@fisdl.gob.sv

La pobreza es definida como una condición humana y social con muchas facetas que aún ahora no tiene un paradigma universal que la defina. En términos muy generales, los seres humanos se consideran pobres cuando no pueden asegurar un mínimo estándar de bienestar o cuando sus opciones y oportunidades por una vida tolerable les son denegadas o considerablemente restringidas.

En este orden de ideas, Claudio Vega (Ohio State University – Introducción a trabajos sobre pobreza realizados por el Programa BASIS y FUSADES), ha señalado la posibilidad de participar y la manera de participar en diferentes mercados (laboral, financiero, agrícola, etc.), es quizás el determinante más importante que marca la diferencia para salir de la pobreza en las poblaciones rurales, las cuales son las que concentran los mayor índices de intensidad y dimensión de la pobreza.

En este aspecto, existen notables evidencias que apoyan esta tesis:

Según Lardé y Argüello (1997): la manera de participar depende del capital humano de las personas, para lo cual el factor educativo es clave: un 100% de incremento de escolaridad en el promedio rural (pasar del tercero al sexto grado) causa en un aumento en la participación en los mercados del 32% lo cual redunda en un incremento del 60% en los ingresos.

Según Beneke (1997), en la oportunidad de participar, además, del factor educativo, el segundo aspecto más importante para elevar la cantidad y calidad del ingreso es la oportunidad de contar con un camino accesible y un medio de transporte moderno hacia los centros de mercado (lo que se denominan "los costos de transacción"), dado que las personas más aisladas se dedican a actividades con bajo nivel de productividad y de ingreso (incrementar en una hora el acceso a una carretera pavimentada o a un centro poblado, redundaría en una disminución de dos años en el promedio educativo y en más de la mitad las probabilidades de tener un ingreso rural arriba de las condiciones de pobreza)

	20% más aislado	20% menos aislado
Agropecuario		
Productor	2.8	4.5
Asalariado	4.8	5.2
Mixto	3.7	3.1
No agropecuario		
Productor	3.9	4.9
Asalariado	5.7	7.6
Mixto	n.a.	5.6
Mixto	2.3	4.8

Nivel educativo promedio en años de estudio entre los grupos poblacionales según su acceso a una vía de comunicación pavimentada o un centro poblado (A. Lardé, FUSADES, 2001, en publicación)

Por lo anterior, los dos aspectos más importantes (aunque no los únicos) para disminuir la pobreza estructural son el acceso a la educación y la inversión en vías de comunicación (física y virtual), por lo que es indispensable la acción del estado para que su capital humano este en una mejor posición para interactuar con su entorno económico (laboral, financiero, agrícola, etc), para evitar que el desarrollo sea elitista, fragmentado y poco profundo (C. Vega, Ibid) con fuertes líneas de inversión en la educación y vías de acceso, principalmente en las zonas rurales que favorezcan la integración y el fortalecimiento de las personas a los mercados.

Intervención de Néstor Vega Jiménez IULA/FLACMA, Ecuador.

Hola a todos:

Primeramente felicitaciones a quienes corresponda por promover esta discusión. Pienso que el tema es de gran interés para el ámbito local y espero que podamos en poco identificar casos sobre el combate a la pobreza desde lo local.

He leído con mucho interés la ponencia de Astrid Fischel Volio, Vicepresidenta de Costa Rica sobre el tema de la pobreza y su batalla desde lo municipal y no puedo más que estar de acuerdo con ella. La tesis central de la ponencia gira alrededor de una descentralización (administrativa) que permita llegar a tener un ayuntamiento como promotor del desarrollo local, en un ambiente en que los ciudadanos y ciudadanas (vecinos y vecinas), de la comunidad han adquirido una madurez política que les hace buscar ser participes en la toma de decisiones y "co-protagonistas de sus empeños por un mejor presente y un luminoso porvenir". Sin embargo, me quedo con

algunas preguntas que pienso probablemente debemos pensar sus respuestas en grupo.

¿Cuál es entonces el papel del gobierno central? ¿Se convierte la propuesta en una situación en que cada ciudad por su lado, busca el desarrollo local? ¿Cuál es el papel de la cooperación internacional?

Es claro, para mí, que la intención de la ponente no era eliminar el papel del gobierno central en la lucha contra la pobreza. Me suena a que lo que la vicepresidenta busca es trabajar coordinadamente entre el gobierno central y el gobierno local. Pero, ¿en qué? ¿Cuáles son las políticas que debe tener el gobierno central y cuál es el papel de los ayuntamientos en esas políticas? ¿Son los ejecutores? ¿Son los intermediarios?

Finalmente, ¿qué pasa con aquellos lugares que nos son viables económicamente hablando (aquellos que no tienen potencialidades para producir cualquier excedente que sea requerido por las otras partes del país, o que carecen de líderes o entrepreneurs para convertir esa comunidad en un lugar viable)?

Tengo todavía algunos comentarios, pero pienso que es un buen momento para parar.

Intervención de Oscar Mancía
PROMUDE, El Salvador.

La pobreza es un tema que a estas alturas debió ser superado por la humanidad ya que la tecnología y la ciencia han avanzado mucho en los últimos 50 años.

Se cuenta en los países desarrollados con muy buena información estadística y de sistematizaciones de procesos, pero no así en nuestros países subdesarrollados en los que se carece de este tipo de información y es difícil planificar, ya que no hay continuidad en los procesos y mucho menos especialización en áreas específicas en las que deberíamos estar apuntando. A manera de ejemplo el transporte público del cual la población no sabe cómo funciona y si existen estudios recientes que evalúen la eficiencia o ineficiencia de estos, ¿cómo ahorrar entonces? . Hay un montón de grifos abiertos que no permiten hacer llegar los recursos a la población o la investigación para mejorar las condiciones de vida de la población.

Mi idea es iniciar un trabajo local que permita contar con diagnósticos por sector y sobre esta base poder planificar el camino que se debe seguir para mejorar las condiciones de la población desde un enfoque integral.

CONCLUSIONES Y RECOMENDACIONES

CONCLUSIONES

Los elementos y factores claves identificados, fueron:

1. La pobreza es una condición humana y social que aún no tiene un paradigma universal que la defina claramente. Los seres humanos se consideran pobres generalmente cuando no pueden asegurar un mínimo estándar de vida y de bienestar.
2. La importancia del componente municipal en la estrategia, dada la relevancia que este Sector tiene ante el Estado, para la implementación de las estrategias por su relación directa con la ciudadanía.
3. Debe existir un equilibrio entre los componentes económicos y sociales de la estrategia que se diseñe y se implemente, entendiendo que la pobreza tiene una dimensión social, una dimensión económica y una dimensión de entorno, estrechamente relacionadas e indivisibles en la vida cotidiana de los pobres.
4. Es importante incorporar en la estrategia, un objetivo educativo que promueva y fortalezca el desarrollo local con amplia participación ciudadana en su consecución.
5. La estrategia debe considerar una orientación prioritaria a desarrollar y fortalecer el tejido productivo presente en los territorios donde la estrategia se implemente.
6. Cualquier estrategia dirigida a superar la pobreza requiere una identificación precisa, para cada territorio y contexto donde se implemente, de los elementos determinantes de la situación de pobreza que afecta a las personas, familias y comunidades de dicho territorio, de manera de reconocer sus particularidades y desde allí encontrar soluciones pertinentes a dichas condiciones propias. Esto resulta especialmente importante en la medida que se reconoce que el fenómeno de la pobreza es diverso, heterogéneo y que es muy complejo diseñar soluciones estándar.
7. Desde el punto de vista metodológico se sugiere que una estrategia debe desarrollarse por fases o etapas y es indispensable tener claridad acerca de los recursos disponibles, tanto humanos como institucionales y financieros, de los mecanismos de toma de decisiones, que incluya un liderazgo y una participación activa de los propios pobres. Cabe destacar que entendemos la participación en este marco como una herramienta que les permite a las personas influir efectivamente en las decisiones que las afectan.
8. Adicionalmente a lo anterior, se planteó como factor relevante la necesidad de una "nueva cultura de transparencia en la función pública" dirigida a prevenir decididamente y a combatir la corrupción que, entre otros efectos, tiene el de mantener y profundizar la situación de pobreza de millones de personas.

RECOMENDACIONES

1. Que dentro de la formulación de una estrategia de combate a la pobreza, siempre se involucre a los sectores afectados para poder implementar de mejor manera el accionar y descienda la ayuda establecida por el gobierno a los sectores más vulnerables.
2. La identificación veraz de los factores de pobreza, con el propósito de conocer sus causas y poder generar los mecanismos necesarios para su erradicación.
3. El desarrollo de mecanismos de retroalimentación participativos, que incluyan la dotación de fondos disponibles, manejados con transparencia y claridad.
4. Que la estrategia incluya acciones de tipo preventivo.
5. Impulsar mecanismos de transparencia en la función pública a través de la promoción de reformas estructurales y jurídicas que prevengan las condiciones de pobreza.
6. Se deben realizar monitoreos periódicos para conocer con profundidad la fuerza de trabajo de la población y su economía.
7. Se deben apoyar los programas educación y formación vocacional como factor clave en la economía y producción del país.
8. Iniciar un trabajo local que permita la formulación de diagnósticos sectoriales que hagan factible la consolidación de un enfoque integral para mejorar las condiciones de la población.

Nota: Para conocer más sobre al temática discutida en esta Conferencia Virtual, puede visitar la página web de Federación de Municipios del Istmo Centroamericano -FEMICA- <http://www.femica.org>

Annex 2: Electronic Newsletters

- 1) LAC Quarterly Newsletter (May 2, 2002)**
- 2) LAC Forum E-Newsletter on Performance Measurement (May 31, 2002)**

**Annex 3: Notes of Presentation by Dr. Subhash
Bhatnagar**

**Enabling E-Government in Developing
Countries: ICTs Bringing Transparency**



Enabling E-Government in Developing Countries: ICTs Bringing Transparency

Dr. Subhash Bhatnagar

World Bank (on leave from the Indian Institute of Management in Ahmedabad)
sbhatnagar@worldbank.org

May 2, 2002

notes by Jason Wolfe, jwolfe@dis.cdie.org

1. PRESENTATION STRUCTURE

- E-Government: different perceptions and delivery models
- Case studies where benefits of reduced corruption and increased transparency were delivered by e-government applications
- Critical success factors in implementing e-government
- Specific areas where aid agencies can help

2. E-GOVERNMENT: SCOPE AND DEFINITION

- E-Government is the application of the tools and techniques of e-commerce to the business of government for the benefit of both government and the citizens and businesses it serves.
- Government agencies use information technologies such as WANs, Internet, World Wide Web, and mobile computing to reach out to citizens, business, and other arms of the government.
- Objectives:
 - Improve delivery of services to citizens
 - Improve interface with business and industry
 - Empower citizens through access to knowledge and information
 - Make government processes more efficient and effective

- Resulting benefits:
 - More transparency
 - Greater convenience
 - Less corruption
 - Increased revenues
 - Reduced costs

3. DIFFERENT VIEWS OF E-GOVERNMENT

- Improve service delivery
 - Reduce corruption and enhance convenience
 - Regulatory agencies have moved but developmental agencies are slow
- Make private sector more competitive
 - Reduce costs of transacting with government
 - Tax collection and e-procurement are popular
- Provide multiple channels of service delivery to citizens and ensure citizen engagement

4. DIFFERENT DELIVERY MODELS

- Departments going online (e-government services available only to government employees)
 - Greater department ownership: significant re-engineering possible
 - Citizens still visit many departments, but service delivery is more efficient
 - Possible first step in the absence of a high bandwidth network
- Conveniently located Service Centers (e-government services available to public, but only at specific locations)
 - Counters staffed by public/private agencies
 - Multiple services available at single location (e.g., payment, licenses, certificates)
 - Can quickly move traffic from departments to service centers
 - Requires significant coordination
- Self-service through a web portal (e-government services available to public anywhere)
 - Requires back-end computerization and integration for data sharing

- Requires high Internet penetration and citizens’ willingness/ability to use
- Requires security and mutual trust (which builds with successful outcomes)
- Usage builds gradually; adoption rate has to be driven
- Requires strong centralized leadership for extensive coordination

5. SOME SUCCESSFUL E-GOVERNMENT APPLICATIONS FROM DEVELOPING COUNTRIES

- CARD in Andhra Pradesh, India; BHOOMI in Karnataka, India
- Citizen Service Centers (mobile) in Bahia, Brazil
- Government procurement in Chile, Mexico, Philippines, and Bulgaria
- New business registration in Jordan, Jamaica, and China
- Tax collection at state border checkpoints in Gujarat, India
- Income tax online in Singapore, Brazil, and Jordan
- Customs online in India, Philippines, and Jamaica
- OPEN (anti-corruption project in Seoul, South Korea)
- All case studies accessible on the World Bank website:
<http://www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/egov/>

6. LAND RECORD MANAGEMENT PRIOR TO COMPUTERIZATION IN KARNATAKA, INDIA

- 20 million records for 6.7 million farmers spread over 9,000 villages
- Village accountant responsible for issuing and changing certificates
- Certificate issuance could take 3-30 days and a bribe of Rs 100-2,000
- Certificate changes could take up to 2 years, though it should take less than 30 days
- Flawed system lead to encroachments on public land

7. LAND RECORD MANAGEMENT AFTER COMPUTERIZATION IN KARNATAKA, INDIA

- Establishment of BHOOMI for the online delivery of certificates
- Farmers can access service from operators in 180 locations
- Certificate issuance takes 10-15 minutes and costs Rs 15
- Requests for certificate changes are filed and tracked online
- Pilot program where citizens can use touch screens for self-service

- Future plans to provide service over the web, accessible at kiosks
- Login procedures use biometric security
- Eliminates corruption through standardized, computerized procedures and video surveillance
- Fosters transparency because citizens can access and view their own records

8. COMPUTERIZED LAND REGISTRATION IN ANDHRA PRADESH, INDIA: CARD

- Implemented in 214 locations in 15 months
 - Clearly identified goals
 - 10% of total expenses went for training
 - Out-sourced software development, data input, and training
 - Detailed project management
- Significant process re-engineering
 - Rules for property valuations (more transparency)
 - Spot inspection
 - Amendment of Registration Act to legally accept scanned copies
- Registration in 1 hour instead of 10 days
- Encumbrance certificate in 15 minutes instead of 7 days
- Intermediaries still exist: public awareness

9. E-PROCUREMENT SYSTEM IN CHILE

- Operated by private sector
- Suppliers register (4,000 in 75 areas) and receive automatic emails
- Handles 18% of public agency procurements
- Online information: contact detail, bid winners, ratings, and historical data on procurement
- Brought centralization, standardization, and redefinition of central agency's role
- Resulted in greater transparency of the government's procurement practices

10. COMPUTERIZATION OF BORDER CHECKPOINTS IN GUJARAT, INDIA

- Situation:

- 10 state border checkpoints
- 128,000 vehicles per day
- 70-80% of trucks are overloaded
- Computerized checkpoint solution:
 - All trucks must pass through new checkpoint
 - Video camera captures and verifies registration number through a central database
 - Electronic scale automatically determines whether truck is overloaded
 - Taxes and fines are automatically calculated
 - Stored value card for payment
 - Checkpoints are monitored centrally with video cameras
- Results
 - Tripled tax revenues
 - Reduced corruption



11. OPEN SYSTEM IN SEOUL, SOUTH KOREA

- Tracks movement of bar/restaurant license applications on the Internet
- Randomizes which applications are reviewed by which civil servants
- Reduces corruption

12. BENEFITS WHEN INFORMATION IS MADE TRANSPARENT

Information made transparent	Resulting benefits
Rules and procedure governing services	Standardizes procedures for delivery of service
Public officials responsible for different tasks	
Citizen's charter	Reduces arbitrariness, e.g. demand for additional documents
Enhancing citizen's exposure	
Information about decisions and actions of government functionaries: outcome and process (e.g. award of contracts and license), allocation of resources.	Exposure of corruption and improved accountability
Data about individual entities in Government records such as land records, comments on application for license, bill of entry for goods, status of tax payments.	Exposure of manipulation for exchange of bribe and corruption
Information on performance of economy: Statistical employment, income, trade etc.	Civic engagement in governance
Performance indicator for Government departments	Greater accountability
Names of citizens with large outstanding loans, taxes; civil servants under investigation or convicted, index of corruption, performance of investigating agencies	A kind of punishment for the corrupt through public exposure
Disclosure of assets, income, profile of election candidates, elected representatives, ministers and civil servants	Creates disincentive for corruption by creating fear of exposure

13. CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTORS

- Clearly identified goals and benefits
- Significant process re-engineering
- Starting small and moving gradually through stages – expectations must be well managed and credibility is key.
- Adopting established standards and protocols – minimize customization
- In-house analysis and outsourced design, software development, data preparation, training, etc.

- Recognizing value of training (expenses should not be minimized)
- Strong political and administrative leadership, detailed project management

14. ENABLERS OF E-GOVERNMENT

- 40% — change in management
- 35% — business process re-engineering
- 20% — technology
- 5% — luck!

15. ORGANIZATION FOR IMPLEMENTING E-GOVERNMENT

- Champion at the political level
- Ministerial level coordination committees
- Central support group
- Departmental champions and coordination committee
- Institution for training
- Private sector partners

16. ROLE OF THE CENTRAL SUPPORT GROUP

- Assessing and enhancing preparedness
- Developing a strategy and implementation plan
- Resources for re-engineering, application development, and change management
- Guidelines, standards, and best practices
- Developing public-private partnerships
- Identifying departmental champions
- Monitoring progress and impact
- Overseeing a few key projects

17. TRAINING AND AWARENESS

- Training for project leaders who can define project deliverables, deal (negotiate) with consultants and vendors, and manage an outsourced development process (IPA).
- Training of clerical staff on specific applications (developers)

- Making citizens aware of online services and how to use portals
- Training supervisors and managers to use information
- Making senior civil servants and political executives aware of e-government benefits and effort needed

18. IN SUMMARY

- E-government can advance the agenda on governance and fiscal reform, transparency, anti-corruption, empowerment, and poverty reduction
- Potential is recognized, but implementation is difficult
- Pioneers have shown that gains can be real
- Challenge is to promote widespread use

19. QUESTIONS & ANSWERS

Q: How is the World Bank helping developing countries develop or implement e-government capacity?

A: 1. Building confidence and knowledge that countries can use e-government (primarily through research and case studies)

2. Making funds available for computers for government officials

3. Making funds available to improve infrastructure so expand outreach of e-government services.

Q: What happened to the village accountants in the BHOOMI case study?

A: Land records constituted only 10% of their workload. Now they are able to focus more on other tasks, with the expectation that they now have the time to improve their performance in those areas.

Q: Factors for critical success seem focused on government — what role do you see for the private sector, NGOs, etc.?

A: Civil society can advance their advocacy role using the transparency afforded by e-government.

Q: What is the difference between e-governance and e-government?

A: E-governance is a broader concept with e-government as a subset. For example, e-governance addresses state (political) corruption, whereas e-government addresses administrative corruption.

Annex 4: Local E-Governance: A Challenge and an Opportunity, Guadalajara, Mexico, June 22, 2002

Program Agenda

**Annex 5: Draft Minutes of Capacity and Institution
Building Platform of IULA
Guadalajara, Mexico, June 23, 2002**

Capacity and Institution Building Platform of IULA

**Meeting in Guadalajara, Mexico
9:00-14:00, 23 June 2002**

Draft Minutes**Welcome and Introductions**

The meeting was opened by the Chair of the Platform, Peter Knip of VNG, who made a special reference to the presence of colleagues from the United Towns Organization, the International Forum for Cooperation on Local Government in Latin American and the Caribbean (The Forum) and IDCN (see attached list of participants).

Both IULA and UTO members have a great interest in ensuring the continuation of the CIB platform in the new world organization and the presence of UTO representatives in this meeting was the first step in that direction.

The Forum was represented by ICMA (Secretariat), World Bank and USAID. Peter Knip celebrated the interest generated by the activities of Local Government at international level and welcomed the opportunity to further develop the existing relations between the different organizations.

Future of the CIB platform

Following the discussions that took place in The Hague meeting and taking advantage of the presence of colleagues from UTO, a lively exchange took place about the shape and activities of the Platform within the framework of the new organization.

Participants agreed the platform is a very useful forum for exchange and that the objectives will still be relevant within the new organization.

It was stressed the platform should remain a practitioners network around municipal international cooperation initiatives. Concerning the inclusion of cities to the platform, it was agreed that only cities with a clear interest and experience in municipal international cooperation should be allowed to join.

The broadening of the network with the establishment of the new world organization will probably implicate more participation from francophone countries and the necessary measures need to be taking concerning the

working languages.

The Secretariat will inform IULA's political leadership of these discussions and will inform Platform members on new developments concerning the structure of the new organization affecting municipal international cooperation work.

WACLAC- UN HABITAT: Partnership for Local Capacity Development

The Partnership aims to foster exchange on decentralized, and city to city cooperation and to become a focal point of information for cities and organizations that are interested in the field, both as providers and as beneficiaries of cooperation.

The partnership would comprise two essential working components: firstly, a continuously updated information base; and secondly, machinery to foster an ongoing policy dialogue and prepare action proposals for all relevant actors. (see document circulated).

Emilia Sáiz stressed the importance of ensuring the experiences of the IULA network will be reflected in the partnership. This new initiative should build upon existing initiatives. The World Secretariat asked the members support to ensure that the web-based database PYMEX, would be used as basis for the information base of the new partnership. An update on the PYMEX initiative followed.

Platform for International Municipal Exchange –PIMEX-

This IULA-United Nations Volunteers Programme aims to stimulate municipal international cooperation through the development of an interactive web-based database system where demands and offers of technical assistance are brought together.

The project, initiated by the IULA World Secretariat, is being developed in two of the Regional Sections: Africa and Latin America.

Néstor Vega Jimenez from IULA-FLACMA-CELCADEL made a short presentation on the progress made since the The Hague meetings and invited participants to visit the new prototype and to submit contributions and suggestions.

www.pimex.org

Password: XEMIP

When viewing the site please note:

- -The Platform is still under construction and therefore not a finished

product;

- -Currently, the most complete version is PIMEX-World in English, with only the products "Internships", "Twinnings", "Experiences" and "Experts in MIC" not functioning as yet;
- -Please use Internet Explorer and not Netscape;
- -The bigger the database, the slower the time of response, e.g. if trying to find a municipality in Spain, the search time can be of up to over a minute. Work is being done to improve this
- -Currently best viewed on 800 x 600 screens;
- -Please feel free to enter test information. However, as this is still a trail version, this data could get lost.

A challenge ahead is the sustainability of this kind of site. This is what makes it important to find support that still ensures the ownership of the initiative by the Local Governments and their associations.

Measuring the impact of our work

If we want to raise more awareness about the importance of Local Governments and of their role in development we need to be able to document our work better and make the result of our efforts more tangible. Although many efforts have been made to define and measure concepts such as good governance, it is important to ensure the local perspective in those descriptions. The Urban Governance Index, an initiative of the Global Campaign on Urban Governance was mentioned as an example where it will be important to provide inputs by the membership.

ICMA representative mentioned an interesting study prepared by the Bertelsman Foundation on how to measure the impact of the use of technology. A summary of this document can be obtained at ICMA and will be used for starting an online discussion on this theme on the Forum site: <http://www.latinterforum.org/index.asp>.

The Learning About Poverty Project carried out by IULA FLACMA and by the UMP with Cities Alliance Financing was presented as a first step to establishing a clear link between poverty alleviation and local government.

The project consisting on the gathering of 10 cases in the Latin American region includes the development of a theoretical framework that links the importance of good local governance with the alleviation of poverty in concrete ways.

A presentation of the project is available from the IULA Secretariat.

A lively discussion followed the presentation by Nestor Vega. Reference was made to the WB report on The Voice of Poverty.

The measurement of the impacts was given more importance than the

output oriented approach that is often followed in project work, e.g. number of trainings and manuals. It was admitted that the measurement of impacts such as behaviour, awareness and practices are very challenging. Participant welcomed the idea to pay attention to these issues in future meetings. The Chair invited members to share their experiences in this area through the world Secretariat.

Funding for Development: A joint article on the local government perspective

VNG has taken the lead during past months on this initiative and is gathering the contributions of the CIB platform members.

The article includes contributions of several LGA's and resource persons within the IULA network. The outline of the material collected so far has been distributed.

The Participant welcomed the initiative and following Barbara den Boer's presentation made the following recommendations:

- The article should give a balanced picture and avoid referring mainly to the imbalance in the distribution of funds between the GO and NGO sector.
- The article should also give reasons why more money should be channelled to the GO sector (added value); what are the potentials of working with local governments;
- Attention should be paid to the relation of the GO sector with the reduction and alleviation of poverty
- The theme of transparency and the need for NGO's to be transparent was underlined and should be reflected upon in the article.

Colleagues from UTO France expressed their interest in providing information on the French situation.

The Platform will be informed on progress made during the next months.

Closer collaboration between the International Daughter Company Network of IULA and the Platform

IDCN is an international network of daughter companies of LGA's. Their members cover a great range of activities and experiences.

IDCN representative Kees Mak underlined the importance of working closer together. IDCN could offer its expertise with regard to income-generating activities within the cooperation programmes that are carried out by the members of the CIB Platform. It could further help the CIB members to know more about the new trends and initiatives in that field. On the other

hand an strengthen partnership with the CIB would facilitate the participation of daughter companies in municipal international cooperation.

The experience of the ACB programme has shown that more and more associations around the world consider it necessary to establish subsidiary corporations. It will be interesting to make good use of the existing skills and learned lessons in the different business areas.

During the coming months concrete steps will be taken to ensure closer collaboration between both networks and active involvement of IDCN in the ACB programme will be sought.

Closing remarks

Peter Knip, closed the meeting thanking all for their presence and underlining the excellent opportunities for networking provided by that the statutory meetings preceding the CIB.

Summary of action points

- Seek of funding to ensure follow-up to the LGAs Development Programme
- Providing inputs to the PIMEX initiative
- Presenting PIMEX as information base within the WACLAC-UN Habitat initiative
- Finalization of the article on Financing for Development

ANNEXES

- List of Participants

Background documents have been circulated to all members. Additional copies are available at the Secretariat upon request.

The Hague,
July 2002

ANNEX I
Participants List

MEMBER ORGANISATION	NAME/S
VNG - Chair	Peter Knip Barbara den Boer Elisabeth Roussel
AMMAC, Mexico	Oscar Vega
FCM Canada	James Knight
FCM Colombia	Gilberto Toro
FEMP, Spain	Jesús Turbidi Perez
LGIB, United Kingdom	Mike Ashley
UVCB, Belgium	Therése Renier
UTO France	Nicolas Wit
UTO Secretariat	Mohamed Boussradui Paollo Morello Edgardo Blisky
IULA World Secretariat	Emilia Sáiz Carrancedo Sarah O'Brien Eliane Blok Richard Neves
IULA-AULA	Charles Katiza
IULA-ASPAC	Terman Siregar Peter Woods
IULA-FEMICA	Patrick Lizama Javier Valdés
IULA-EMME	Selahatin Yildirim
IULA-FLACMA-CELCADEL	Néstor Vega Jimenez Jaime Torres Lara
IULA-NORAM	Jim Brooks
IULA Partners	
IDCN	Kees Mak
ICMA, USA	Isabelle Bully Omictin
World Bank	Jacqueline Dubow
USAID	Paul Frits Noreene Janus Maria Barrón
Ministry of LG Malasya	Md. Nor Zariffin

**Annex 6: E-Learning: An Option for Local
Government Training in Latin America and the
Caribbean, June 2002**

E-Learning: An Option for Local Government Training in Latin America & the Caribbean

June 2002

Prepared by:

**Technical and Executive Secretariat of the International Forum for
Cooperation on Local Government in Latin America and the Caribbean**

**U.S. Agency for International Development
Cooperative Agreement No. LAG-A-00-98-00060-00**

Contents

Introduction.....	1
What is e-learning?	1
Distance Education	3
Synchronous and Asynchronous Communication.....	3
Knowledge Management	4
Reusable Learning Objects	6
Online Communities – Increasing the Possibility of Networking.....	7
Blended Learning.....	7
Why e-learning?.....	9
Benefits	9
Responsiveness to Municipal Needs	10
A Global Phenomenon.....	11
What are the key elements to consider when developing e-learning components to local government training for Latin America?	14
Ensure Connectivity	14
Do Not Repeat “Bad Habits” of Traditional Training.....	16
Measure the Impact of Training.....	19
What steps are needed to address the existing gap in training while promoting e-learning?.....	21
Establish Performance Standards for Municipalities and Municipal Officials.....	21
Perform a Diagnostic of Current Training Practices by Country	21
Provide Performance Support Through Knowledge Management.....	22
What can donors/international cooperation agencies do to promote e-learning programs in LAC?.....	23
Encourage Connectivity	24
Leverage Existing Resources and Programs	25
Promote High Quality Learning Programs	26
Conclusion.....	27

Tables

Table 1: Examples of Learning Technologies	4
Table 2: Training vs. Knowledge Management	5
Table 3: Blended Learning Options.....	7
Table 4: Characteristics of Pedagogy vs. Andragogy	18
Table 5: Kirkpatrick’s Classic Four Levels of Evaluation	20

Annexes

Annex A. U.S. Examples of E-Learning Initiatives
Annex B. LAC Examples of E-Learning Initiatives
Annex C. Advantages and Disadvantages of Nine Basic Needs Assessment Techniques

Preface

The purpose of this discussion paper is to provide an overview of the current state of the e-learning industry, a summary about adult learning and performance, and illustrative examples of applications in the United States and Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC). The document also contains recommendations and guidelines for donor and technical cooperation agencies that are currently engaged in e-learning in LAC or that are planning to design and implement e-learning activities in the region. We hope that this paper and the recommendations will stimulate a dialogue among institutions interested and involved in e-learning so that some type of consensus can be reached as to how – or whether – to promote e-learning throughout the hemisphere in a more systematic and effective manner. The Secretariat is planning to form a task force on e-learning, including experts from the private and public sectors, to help steer the discussion of the members of the Forum and provide useful information on trends in the field, and to enable those agencies interested in pursuing e-learning to better design and implement their programs. The Secretariat will hold or cosponsor several events (virtual and physical) over the next 20 months on the topic of e-learning.

The authors of this paper, the Technical and Executive Secretariat of the International Forum for Cooperation on Local Government in Latin America and the Caribbean (Forum), are not attempting to write the definitive text on e-learning and realize that there are many resources available. We have put together a list of resources in the field of e-learning, which individuals interested in the topic can use in conducting further research on the topic.

E-Learning: An Option for Local Government Training in Latin America & the Caribbean

Introduction

In Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC), continued decentralization means that the ability of local governments to meet the needs of citizens is increasingly important in the context of both economic development and the consolidation of democracy. In the late 1970s, only 3,000 communities in the LAC region elected their own local leaders, while in the 1990s that number had risen to about 16,000 local governments. Tens of thousands of elected officials and staff throughout the region have taken on new responsibilities in emerging democratic systems.

Given the urgent need for training of elected and appointed officials, and staff at the sub-national level, the donor community – in addition to national governments, educational institutions, firms, and associations that support local government – should consider the power and potential of e-learning. Through electronic means, larger audiences can be reached at a lower per-person cost. Advances in Internet-based learning and increasing access to the Internet throughout the world make e-learning a good choice for meeting the training and human resource development needs of both the public and private sectors.

While the revenue as well as reach of the e-learning industry will continue to expand, the pervasive view that all things “e” will replace everything else (in the same way that the existence of computers would eliminate the need for paper) has waned, and a more balanced perspective is emerging. E-Learning is seen as an *option* among other types of training and tends to be “blended” with traditional training. E-Learning encompasses knowledge management and makes information available at the specific moment it is needed in ways that traditional training cannot.

The promise of learning opportunities when delivered through technology, in comparison to traditional, face-to-face training, is easy to imagine. For traditional training to take place, participants must find funding, obtain permission to attend, take time off from work, and travel just to get to the course. They attend the course, hopefully learn subjects that will enhance their performance, and return to find work piled up. In addition, only a limited number of participants can attend. With e-learning, once a course is prepared, an unlimited number of participants can attend from the comfort of their own office, home, or community center. Participants save time and money, with few interruptions in their daily work.

What is e-learning?

Before discussing the applicability of e-learning for local government training in Latin America, it is important to agree on what is meant by learning in the context of work, and to define what e-learning is and what it is not.

First of all, learning is the process by which people acquire new skills and knowledge for the purpose of *enhancing their performance*.¹ Enhancing performance is crucial: Any learning opportunity (classroom training, distance education, computer simulations, Internet-based courses, professional exchanges) must strive to help participants enhance their performance, or it is not achieving its purpose. This shift in emphasis from training to performance also shifts the emphasis from the training activity itself to the impact that the training activity has. This means that various mechanisms designed to improve performance can be included in training activities, even though they may not fit into the narrower definition of training.

As a reflection of this trend, the mission statement of the American Society for Training and Development reads, “ASTD is the world’s leading association of workplace learning and performance professionals.” ASTD, which has more than 70,000 members from more than 100 countries, is focusing many efforts on e-learning and the use of technology to enhance performance. ASTD’s definition of e-learning as stated in its E-Learning Glossary is:

E-Learning: Covers a wide set of applications and processes such as Web-based learning, computer-based learning, virtual classrooms, and digital collaboration. It includes the delivery of content via Internet, intranet/extranet (LAN/WAN), audio- and videotape, satellite broadcast, interactive TV, and CD-ROM.²

Or, in other words, “...anything delivered, enabled, or mediated by electronic technology for the explicit purposes of learning...”³

In his recent book, Marc J. Rosenberg says that e-learning is the “use of Internet technologies to deliver a broad array of solutions that enhance knowledge and performance.” For purposes of promoting e-learning for local governments in LAC, his definition may be too narrow, but it is important to acknowledge that the trend within e-learning is moving away from CD-ROMs and satellite broadcasts in favor of networked options. Rosenberg’s definition of e-learning is more specific than ASTD’s. In his analysis, he uses the term “technology-based learning” to include non-Internet/intranet means of providing training electronically. Rosenberg describes three fundamental criteria upon which e-learning is based:

- *E-Learning is networked, which makes it capable of instant updating, storage/retrieval, distribution, and sharing of instruction or information.* So important is this capability that it is fast becoming an absolute requirement of e-learning. As useful as CD-ROMs (and DVDs) are for instruction and information delivery, they lack the networkability that enables information and instruction to be distributed and updated instantly. So while CD-ROMs are indeed technology-based learning systems, they should not be classified as e-learning.
- *It is delivered to the end-user via a computer using standard Internet technology.* The key characteristic is the use of standard Internet technologies, such as the TCP/IP protocol and Web browsers that create a universal delivery platform.
- *It focuses on the broadest view of learning – learning solutions that go beyond the traditional paradigms of training.* E-Learning is not limited to the delivery of instruction, characterized

¹ Rosenberg, Marc J. *E-Learning Strategies for Delivering Knowledge in the Digital Age*, McGraw Hill. 2001. p. 7.

² The complete glossary can be found at www.learningcircuits.org/glossary.html.

³ Conley, Larry. Presentation June 4, 2001, ASTD Conference, Orlando, FL.

by computer-based training (CBT). E-Learning goes beyond training to include the delivery of information and tools that improve performance. For the same reason, Web-based training (WBT) and Internet-based training (IBT) are simply more up-to-date descriptions of CBT and are also too limiting as a description of e-learning.⁴

It is important to emphasize that e-learning is not just a new technology for learning, it is an opportunity for a new way to think about learning. People learn from access to well-designed information, through experience, and from each other. To say that e-learning is simply switching from classroom training to Internet-based training is to miss the point of the discussion entirely.

There are many specific terms related to the e-learning industry. Some other important aspects of e-learning that should be defined here include distance education, synchronous and asynchronous communication, knowledge management, reusable learning objects, online communities, and blended learning.

Distance Education

An important related term often used instead of e-learning is distance learning, which tends to relate more to distance education. The American Society for Training and Development defines distance education as an:

Educational situation in which the instructor and students are separated by time, location, or both. Education or training courses are delivered to remote locations via synchronous or asynchronous means of instruction, including written correspondence, text, graphics, audio and videotape, CD-ROM, on-line learning, audio- and videoconferencing, interactive TV, and facsimile. Distance learning does not preclude the use of the traditional classroom. The definition of distance education is broader and entails the definition of e-learning.⁵

In the same glossary, distance learning is defined as the desired outcome of distance education. The two terms are often used interchangeably. While ASTD seeks to differentiate the terms e-learning, distance education, and distance learning, our review of various publications, presentations, and other resources shows that the terms are often used interchangeably.

Synchronous and Asynchronous Communication

Synchronous, two-way communication for group learning, and asynchronous, one-way communication for independent learning, are forms of learning that can take place both on- and offline. The following table lists options under each type.

⁴ Rosenberg, Marc J. *E-Learning Strategies for Delivering Knowledge in the Digital Age*, McGraw Hill. 2001. pp. 28-29.

⁵ www.learningcircuits.org/glossary.html.

Table 1: Examples of Learning Technologies

Synchronous Communication Two-Way Communication Group Learning	Asynchronous Communication One-Way Communication Independent Learning
<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Telephone▪ Live cable TV▪ Live satellite TV▪ Closed circuit TV▪ Teleconferencing▪ Computer-based training▪ Videoconferencing via compressed video▪ Desktop videoconferencing▪ Electronic chat rooms▪ Electronic bulletin boards	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Textbooks, guides, handbooks, manuals▪ Audiotapes, CDs, minidisks▪ Radio▪ Film, videotape▪ Compact disc interactive (CD)▪ Digital video interactive (DVI)▪ Digital video disc (DVD)▪ Computer-assisted instruction (CAI)▪ Computer-based instruction▪ Computer-assisted learning▪ Computer-managed instruction (CMI)▪ Cable TV▪ Prerecorded satellite TV▪ E-mail▪ Remote login (Telnet)▪ Online databases▪ Web sites

Source: Mantyla, Karen. *Blending E-Learning*. ASTD. 2001. p. 97.

Today, trainers often blend communication strategies to best convey the knowledge or skills that the learner needs.

Knowledge Management

A key advantage of e-learning is that the learner can access both training opportunities and information, which can help him/her learn via the Internet. Knowledge management is a crucial component of making the information on the Internet accessible and useful to the end-users. ASTD defines knowledge management as:

Capturing, organizing, and storing knowledge and experiences of individual workers and groups within an organization and making it available to others in the organization. The information is stored in a special database called a knowledge base.⁶

Knowledge management is what allows e-learning to go beyond traditional classroom training by making information and training available to participants when they need it and as they need it. Learners can pull information from the knowledge base to answer questions or solve problems as they arise. Table 2 contrasts traditional training with knowledge management.

⁶ www.learningcircuits.org/glossary.html.

Table 2: Training vs. Knowledge Management

Training	Knowledge Management
Purpose is to instruct Requires the interruption of work to participate (even online) Program dictates how the user will learn Goal is to transfer skills and knowledge to user	Purpose is to inform Normally requires less work interruption than training User determines how s/he will learn Goal is to be a resource to user
<i>Example</i> Teaching selling skills	<i>Example</i> Accessing customer information in preparation for a sales call

Rosenberg, Marc J. *E-Learning Strategies for Delivering Knowledge in the Digital Age*, McGraw Hill. 2001. p. 78.

Knowledge management is the system within which learning objects (see below) are organized so that the learner can easily retrieve them. Today, there are numerous products that assist in the organization, storage, and retrieval of information, such as *Sharenet*, *Documentum*, *Oracle*, *DocuShare*, and *Question* among many others.⁷ The information stored can include a range of items such as documents, products, and training modules, and all of them should be updatable, well organized, and applicable.

Knowledge management using the Internet or an intranet makes many resources available to the learner and facilitates information sharing. The goal, however, is not to include all information, but rather valuable and purposeful information that is useful to the learner and the organization. Marc Rosenberg explains, "The challenge is building this capability (knowledge management) so that it is flexible and dynamic, easy to understand and manage, valued by people and supportive of a broad based learning culture. It's the use of knowledge that counts, not just its storage!"⁸

IBM Uses Knowledge Management for Cross-Cultural Information

One small part of IBM resources available for staff online illustrates the application of knowledge management. IBM has staff working around the world. Managers and others who travel to various countries or interact by phone or e-mail are in constant need of information regarding cultural specifics such as protocol and etiquette. To assist staff, IBM made specific information about 57 countries available over the Web. An independent survey found that IBM staff prefer the Web site over cross-cultural classes or books. Ninety-eight percent of users would recommend the site to others, and 20 percent of the visits were during the weekend or after hours. IBM saved more than \$2 million using this knowledge management tool.

Source: "Trends, Tools & Strategies for Knowledge Transfer in the New Economy," presented by Dr. Margaret Driscoll, Director Strategies & Ventures, IBM Mindspace Solutions. Presented at ASTD 2001 International Conference & Exposition, June 3-7, 2001.

⁷ Source: www.ewenger.com, "Supporting communities of practice, a survey of community-oriented technologies." Version 1.3, p. 11.

⁸ Rosenberg, Marc J. *E-Learning Strategies for Delivering Knowledge in the Digital Age*, McGraw Hill. 2001. p. 66.

Reusable Learning Objects

A learning object (or knowledge object) is the smallest “chunk” of instruction or information that can stand alone and still have meaning to a learner.⁹ It is a discrete unit of instruction and content focused on a competency or performance area. Learning objects are comprised of small chunks of learning, interchangeable modules, units, or lessons. The learning objects can be as small or as large as the organization determines necessary. Generally, smaller tends to be better because the objects are then more reusable for various purposes.¹⁰ Depending on the need, individual learning objects can be used to build a training course, incorporated into a presentation, pulled on demand from a user who needs immediate training to complete a task, or placed on a Web site targeted to a specific audience.

For application within local governments in LAC or any other region, an example of a learning object could be the specific route of waste collection for a given town or zone of a city, including maps. Another learning object might include instructions for using the garbage truck—proper driving speeds and how to load and unload garbage. Another might include an overview of how to maintain the truck on a daily, weekly, monthly, and biannually basis. New garbage collectors would be able to take an online orientation course that includes the first three modules, or learning objects. This online orientation would be supplemented with actual practice supervised by an experienced garbage collector.

With e-learning, learning objects are typically stored electronically. For the development of an online course, a training developer chooses the learning objects that will meet the needs of the specific group of participants and puts them together, adding details pertinent to the specific group or topic.

When the same learning objects are stand-alone training modules, they may be stored in a way that allows “just-in-time” access to them (access at the moment they are needed). One common example is a customer service situation in which the representative answers the phone and is asked a question about a product or service with which s/he is unfamiliar. Using the computer, the representative can pull up a specific learning object providing details about that product and provide the information to the customer on the phone. This is an example of how knowledge management transforms e-learning into more than traditional training or education online. The learner has the ability to get needed information—and learn—on his/her own in a very short timeframe.

It’s important to note that trainers can develop learning objects without the use of technology. It is possible to document and share learning objects in a written, longhand form. Technology helps facilitate the sharing of this information in a way not previously possible, but the *content is still the key*. Referring back to the customer service example: in the absence of technology, guidelines regarding each product would be on file and take longer to access, but they are still considered learning objects.

⁹ Rosenberg, Marc J. *E-Learning Strategies for Delivering Knowledge in the Digital Age*, McGraw Hill. 2001. p. 170.

¹⁰ Thomas, Jones, and Kenworthy. June 4, 2001. ASTD Conference, Orlando, FL.

Online Communities – Increasing the Possibility of Networking

Discussion groups; learning communities; peer exchanges; and, for those who can use e-mail, discussion groups or sites for information exchange can complement the very popular conference learning and networking environment. Online communities provide a meeting place for learners on the Internet. They are designed to facilitate interaction and collaboration among people who share common interests and needs. Certainly for local governments spread throughout a country, online communities can provide exceptional networking and learning opportunities. Online communities interact in chat rooms, through e-mail lists, or through online courses.

Communities of practice are emerging as an important part of learning strategies at large corporations. They are more formal, online communities specifically focused on a domain of knowledge and over time accumulate expertise in this domain. They develop their shared practice by interacting around problems, solutions, and insights, and build a common store of knowledge.¹¹ Communities of practice come together online to share information; the right system can capture that information so that others can refer to it in the future. This sharing can contribute to the institution's knowledge management.

Blended Learning

Blended learning takes advantage of various training/learning options to best meet the needs of the learners. Prior to participating in face-to-face classroom training, participants might have to take a preliminary exam via the Internet, participate in an orientation, or complete an assignment with peers using e-mail or a chat room. The classroom training might cover more in-depth topics that require intensive dialogue or demonstrations, which are more difficult to complete online. Days, months, or even years later, information available on the Web about the course content, related topics, or updated materials allow the learner to go back and find information that is not readily available or that s/he cannot remember.

The type of learning activity selected for a given objective should be based on upon the best use of resources available to meet the learner's needs. Online learning is seen not as a replacement for traditional training, but as a supplemental or alternative method. Karen Mantyla in the new book, *Blending E-Learning, The Power is in the Mix*, says that blending training methods, "means taking two or more presentation and distribution methods and combining them to enhance the learning content and experience for the learner."

Table 3: Blended Learning Options

Instructional Methods	Presentation Methods	Distribution Methods
<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Case study▪ Demonstration▪ Expert panels▪ Games▪ Group discussion▪ Lecture▪ Practical experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Audio▪ CBT▪ Electronic performance support system▪ Groupware▪ Interactive TV▪ Multimedia	<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Audiotape▪ Cable TV▪ CD-ROM▪ Computer disk▪ Digital video disc (DVD)▪ E-mail▪ Extranet

¹¹ Source: www.ewenger.com, "Supporting communities of practice, a survey of community-oriented technologies." Version 1.3 p. 1.

Instructional Methods	Presentation Methods	Distribution Methods
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Programmed instruction ▪ Reading ▪ Role play ▪ Simulation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Online help ▪ Teleconferencing ▪ Three dimensional modeling (virtual reality) ▪ Video 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Internet ▪ Intranet ▪ Local area network/wide area network (LAN/WAN) ▪ Satellite TV ▪ Tactile gear/simulator ▪ Telephone ▪ Videotape ▪ Voicemail ▪ World Wide Web

Source: Mantyla, Karen. *Blending E-Learning*. ASTD. 2001. p. 1.

The presentation and distribution methods that trainers select should best support the kind of learning activity that will take place. The focus of various learning activities is explained very clearly by Michelle Glowacki-Dudka¹²:

- *Content-focused* activities often involve reading or presenting the materials so that they are clearly understood and remembered. These activities might include discussion, lecture, case studies, videos, or review of a Web page to promote understanding of the content.

An example of this kind of activity used to enhance the performance of local government officials might be a case study, posted online, about the success of a municipality encouraging the diversification of economic activity. By reading the well-prepared case study, the local government official becomes familiar with the content and concepts presented in the study.

- *Process-focused* activities are designed so the learners gain experience from doing something. This type of activity may include a physical process, such as dancing or typing, or a mental process, such as a strategic planning workshop or a debate. The activity is meant to teach how to do something so that it can be replicated in a real situation.

An online example might include a program that helps learners become competent in managing a database program, which they will use to transfer handwritten cadastre information to an electronic format. Another example might be a workshop in which local government decision makers participate in a role play to gain experience in facilitating a strategic planning debate with citizens, which they will later apply in their own community. Unlike reading the case study to learn about the results of a process, the emphasis here is on participating in the process.

- *Interaction-focused* activities are designed around the interaction of two or more people. The learner not only gains competency in the specific area but also learns about attitudes, perspectives, and social expectations through the interaction with other people. Examples of this type of activity are mentoring and cooperative learning groups.

Using the Internet, mayors who participate in a cooperative learning group might exchange opinions and experiences synchronously through a "chat room" or asynchronously through an e-mail list or bulletin board on the Internet. Following a workshop on strategic planning for economic development, in which mayors from small municipalities participate in activi-

¹² Mantyla, Karen. *Blending E-Learning*. ASTD. 2001. pp. 112-113.

ties to build their skills in working with citizens to prepare a strategic plan, they can use an e-mail list to share their own experience of implementing the process in their community. They can ask each other questions to help resolve problems and share successes and failures, which may help their colleagues avoid the same problems.

- Activities focused on *skill building* are often repetitive and designed to give positive and negative reinforcement to the learner depending on how well s/he is performing. A primary activity for skill building is the drill-and-practice. Skill building is often the focus of workplace or technical training, but it can also be the focus for learning vocabulary or basic math or language skills.

Municipalities with staff who have limited education might look toward courses on the Internet developed for those in need of basic skills. These courses, which should include many types of activities, would likely emphasize exercises to reinforce basic skills such as mathematics. A staff person could spend lunch or off-work hours to increase basic skills via the Internet, benefiting the individual as well as the municipality.

- Activities that promote *critical thinking* can accompany most other learning focuses. Critical thinking consists of the reorganization of knowledge in meaningful and usable ways that involve evaluation, analyzing, and connecting information. Therefore, by thinking critically, learners can evaluate the appropriateness of what they are reading or hearing and can understand the content through their own perspective. Activities such as reflecting, journaling, and role-playing are important for courses on critical thinking.

Any training program – traditional, face-to-face, or online – can include critical thinking activities that ask the learner to be reflective and apply what is learned. The ability to adapt and apply what is learned to one's own situation is essential to success.

Even in a traditional training session, there should be a mix of the above activities. Blended learning goes beyond the mix of activities to blend the presentation and distribution methods – via the Internet or otherwise. How to distribute the mix is influenced by the budget, skills of the trainers and technicians, availability of hardware and software or other technology of the learners, and the desired scale of impact.

Blended learning approaches that bring together e-learning, traditional classroom, and even correspondence courses are increasingly the norm for corporations, universities, and other organizations in the United States. Use of the “blended” approach continues to increase over strictly face-to-face, traditional training. This is not necessarily the case in Latin America, where the predominant approach continues to be traditional classroom training with an emphasis on content-focused and process-focused activities.

Why e-learning?

Benefits

Cost Savings. Corporations save money by increasing the speed at which large numbers of people are trained and by decreasing travel and lodging expenses. This presumes, in almost every case, that staff already have access to the Internet or intranet; therefore, those costs are not included in the costs of the learning/training function because the networks are provided for

other corporate activities. Also, time away from the job is often decreased because the learner can skip irrelevant elements and move through the module at his/her own speed.

Outreach. Universities increase their availability to students vis-à-vis the Internet, which allows them to increase their tuition-paying student body without increasing the number of students on campus, thus increasing their overall revenue. And, in many cases, online universities seek to fill the gap for students who, due to schedule or geographic conflicts, cannot afford to attend traditional courses.

Just-in-time. Learning via the Internet provides training to the learner when and where s/he wants or needs to learn. This makes e-learning especially attractive to the adult learner who has other demands on his or her time. Educational programs for young students can be referred to as “just-in-case” they might need it in the future. Online learning is “just-in-time” and due to the improvements in learning objects and knowledge management is becoming increasingly “just-for-me”; in other words, personalized. For just-in-time learning to be effective, supervisors have to be willing to allow time for training on the job because most learners will not do job-related coursework at home.

Consistency in Content. Because a module is developed once and then distributed to an infinite number of learners, the content is more consistent than if the course is repeated a series of times for various groups. This consistency can be especially important for precise directions and policies that need to be communicated clearly, or controversial topics that should be presented consistently.

Responsiveness to Municipal Needs

In Latin America and the Caribbean, there are more than 16,000 municipalities and tens of thousands of municipal employees. In addition, there are thousands of elected officials who often come into office with limited or no local government experience or knowledge about local government management.

Traditional training cannot meet the needs of all the municipalities. The constraints of time, distance, and financial resources make it very expensive for municipal officials and staff to build capacity and learn the skills necessary to perform well in their positions on a regular basis. Furthermore, if training is provided in the traditional sense of an in-classroom, one-time-only program (usually at the beginning of a mayor’s term), the cycle will have to be repeated again once a new administration takes office.

E-Learning, along with advances in the use of technology for information sharing, makes it possible that in the future, all municipalities throughout LAC can at least benefit from access to updated and relevant information for decision making, including training. This access could improve the effectiveness and efficiency of municipal services and operations. E-Learning and the use of technological tools such as interactive CD-ROMs or online programs will enable municipal officials and staff to lower costs of training, provide ongoing training opportunities, and quickly train new staff.

There are a number of positive developments in Latin America that are contributing to the provision of information to municipalities. In the past decade, for example, municipal associations throughout the region have become stronger and more able to provide services to members via the Internet, such as tools for improving their technical and managerial skills, information on laws, training and technical assistance opportunities, and innovations in municipal management.

Through a USAID-funded Cooperative Agreement, two of the regional associations representing local government associations in Latin America – IULA/FLACMA (International Union of Local Authorities/Federation of Latin American Cities and Municipalities) and FEMICA (Federation of Municipalities of the Central American Isthmus) – have been able to introduce information technology to their members and promote its use among them. IULA (www.iula.net), through the REDCOMUN initiative, organized workshops throughout Latin America to provide municipal association representatives with technological tools to enable them to facilitate activities in areas such as training, local economic development, and ethics. FEMICA (www.femica.org) has developed a Web site that features a *Mochila del Alcalde*, which includes manuals and practical tools for mayors to assist them in carrying out their responsibilities, and a municipal dictionary, with hundreds of terms commonly used in municipal management. National municipal associations, such as AMMAC in Mexico (www.ammac.org), the *Asociación Chilena de Municipios*, through its MUNITEL portal (www.munitel.cl), and the *Federación de Asociaciones de Municipios*, FAM, in Bolivia, through the ENLARED portal (www.enlared.org.bo), are among many associations using technology as a tool for improving municipal management, strengthening their associations, and promoting citizen participation in local government decision making.

A Global Phenomenon

E-Learning in the United States

E-Learning is undoubtedly here to stay. According to the Commission on Technology and Adult Learning, there are more than 5,000 suppliers in the global e-learning industry. The Commission, sponsored by the American Society for Training and Development (ASTD) and the National Governor's Association, released a report in June 2001, called "A Vision of E-Learning for America's Workforce."¹³ The report states that in the United States, corporate e-learning is a \$1.2 billion market, and it is expected to grow to a \$7 billion market by 2003. Cost savings, just-in-time learning, consistency of information, and faster time to achieve competency are all reasons that e-learning has been embraced and will continue to grow.

The seriousness and the long-term importance of e-learning is reflected in the participation of business and public sector leaders throughout the United States on the Commission that produced the paper. Representatives of General Motors University, Mindspace Solutions at IBM, AT&T, Chase Manhattan Bank, the State of Iowa, and the U.S. Department of Commerce, among many others participated in the drafting of a statement about the learning revolution that is taking place and the need to:

¹³ This paper can be found at www.astd.org/virtual_community/public_policy/jh_ver.pdf.

1. Create the highest-quality e-learning experience possible.
2. Implement new measures and methods for assessing and certifying what individuals know and are able to do.
3. Ensure broad and equitable access to e-learning opportunities.¹⁴

Business Week recently noted that even with the bursting of the dot.com bubble, online educational programs continue to surge. In the United States it is estimated that 5 million students will study online by 2006. Today that number is already 2 million. The vast majority of those students are working adults who must juggle education with work and family.¹⁵

Universities and commercial enterprises have been flocking to the World Wide Web with courses in a variety of fields because of the potential for profits. Online distance learning is expected to generate \$1.1 billion in annual tuition revenue from 500,000 students by 2002, according to a Goldman Sachs report.

Among industry leaders, it is anticipated that economies of scale will force a convergence of the distance education industry, as has occurred in communications, banking, and manufacturing. The biggest telecommunications, software, and training (university and corporate) players are betting huge sums on distance education's future market. Many think this investment will drive a convergence, not only of content providers (traditionally universities and training organizations), deliverers, and technology firms but also of types of education: lifelong learning (adult education, technical training, and on-the-job training) and traditional university education. U.S. corporations like Microsoft, IBM/Lotus, and PictureTel; communications firms like AT&T and TCI; publishers like McGraw-Hill; and content providers from New York University to the University of Phoenix are all forming partnerships and investing heavily in the promise of a huge distance education market.

A good place to start in order to get a sense of the vast number of available courses and degrees is CyberU (www.cyberu.com) or the following sites: www.lifelonglearning.com or www.dlcoursefinder.com. Many of the courses and programs in the United States are related to local government. In Annex A we include a few examples of these programs, features of which may be adaptable to the LAC region.

E-Learning in the LAC Region

In LAC, the relative newness of the Internet and the issue of access have led to a somewhat slow development of e-learning in the region. Nonetheless, multiple sources acknowledge that access to and use of the Internet is growing faster in Latin America than in any other region. Due to the mainstreaming of e-learning as a human resource tool in the private sector and its rapid extension to the university setting, it will be only a matter of time before applications of e-learning are more commonplace. In this vein, IBM already offers e-learning solutions in LAC.¹⁶

Today, distance education or e-learning is found in many countries of the region. The University of New Mexico includes a long list of distance learning programs in Latin America orga-

¹⁴ Ibid., p. 17.

¹⁵ *Business Week*, "Giving it the Old On-line Try", December 3, 2001.

¹⁶ www-3.ibm.com/services/learning/global/news/NEWS_27626.html.

nized by country on its Web site.¹⁷ There are examples of e-learning provided by institutions of higher education and others that provide distance education at lower levels. From Virtual Post Graduate Studies at the *Universidad de Nueva Esparta* in Venezuela to the Open Doors global network for distance education via the Internet in Uruguay to the Webducation in Colombia, much activity in distance learning is taking place.¹⁸ Argentina, Brazil, Mexico, and Chile are at the forefront with various institutions offering courses in business administration, public relations, and import/export, among other topics.¹⁹

In an effort to advance distance learning in the region, Lucent Technologies is funding a collaborative effort between Bell Labs and universities in Brazil, Mexico, and the United States. The Lucent Technologies Foundation is providing \$1.5 million over three years to fund the Partnership in Global Learning (PGL) project. The collaborative effort represents an unprecedented international initiative designed to produce and distribute learning on a global scale using technologically enhanced distance learning methods. It will develop state-of-the-art curricula in science and telecommunications technology as well as in other academic fields. The University of Florida, in collaboration with the Technological Institute of Higher Education of Monterrey (Mexico), the *Fundação Getulio Vargas* (Brazil), the *Pontifica Universidade Catolica* (Brazil), and the *Universidade de Campinas* (Brazil), is spearheading the pilot project. The University of Florida is a leader in Latin American studies in the United States, and the four universities from Latin America are recognized as the leading academic institutions in the region.

The learning arm of the World Bank, the World Bank Institute (WBI) www.worldbank.org/wbi, uses the latest technology to connect the developing world with worldwide knowledge and expertise. Learning centers at universities, institutes, and other organizations throughout the developing world offer WBI courses, seminars, and “global dialogues” fostering the free exchange of information. These cost-effective electronic classrooms provide access to knowledge via satellite technology, video teleconferencing, and the Internet. Distance learning is a major part of the WBI’s strategy for disseminating information. Technology helps the Institute build regional and international communities of development practitioners, researchers, and others who share expertise and experiences. WBI spearheaded the World Bank’s [Global Development Learning Network](#) of 27 independently owned and operated learning and research centers around the world, including 9 in Latin America (Bolivia, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Dominican Republic, Ecuador, Nicaragua, and Peru). The network is expected to grow to 50 by 2002 and to 100 by 2005.

In Annex B, we highlight several examples of other online professional development programs in Latin America, namely those of the Technological Institute of Higher Education of Monterrey (Mexico) and the *Instituto Tecnológico Superior* (TECSUP), Peru.

¹⁷lib.nmsu.edu/subject/bord/laguia.

¹⁸ This site provides a list of providers of distance education: lanic.utexas.edu/la/region/distance/.

¹⁹ For a look at the variety of courses, visit lanic.utexas.edu/la/region/distance/.

What are the key elements to consider when developing e-learning components to local government training for Latin America?

Now that we have defined e-learning, examined its benefits, and explored it as a global phenomenon, it is important to discuss the conditions needed to facilitate the development of e-learning as an effective option for improving the performance of local government officials and staff.

Ensure Connectivity

During the 2001 Summit of the Americas, government leaders from 34 Latin American countries committed to supporting “connectivity” and to making the Internet accessible in their countries.²⁰ The leaders stated:

We share the goal of providing all citizens of the Americas with the opportunity to develop the tools to access and share knowledge that will allow them to fully seize opportunities to strengthen democracy, create prosperity and realize their human potential. Connectivity will open new opportunities to our society in all areas, for which equal access and appropriate training are necessary.²¹

Throughout the world, the option of learning online is expanding, and the need to ensure the quality of and access to this educational option is great. In LAC there is concern that the vast gap between rich and poor may become even wider with the growing use of the World Wide Web for business and education. However, there is encouraging news that although the digital divide between the United States and LAC is wide, it is getting smaller. The commitment of leaders throughout the hemisphere to close it further is encouraging. IDG.net reports:

Jupiter Media Matrix recently raised its Internet-usage forecast for the region. Jupiter expects Latin America to have 77 million users by 2005 – roughly 18 percent of the population. That would mark a big improvement over the current figure of 15 million users – about 4 percent of the region’s population. But the region’s numbers would still be small compared with those in the U.S., where more than 60 percent of the population of 284 million is already on-line.²²

The history of Internet use and connectivity in Latin America is summarized by Mr. Saul Hahn of the Organization of American States in a presentation that was made at the Workshop on Data Communication in Latin America and the Caribbean, which took place on April 3-5, 2001, in San Jose, Costa Rica.²³ From this we can see that from 1989 to the present, all countries in the LAC region have connected to the Internet. Often, the universities have been the first to get online, but the spillover effect has included the private sector and government.

²⁰ To review the Summit of the Americas connectivity statement, go to www.summit-americas.org/April-Eng.htm.

²¹ The full statement can be found on the Web site of the Organization of American States, www.oas.org, under the Declaration of Quebec.

²² Source: idg.net, “The Digital Divide Shrinks Between U.S. and Latin America,” Daniel Helft, May 30, 2001.

²³ Source: www.redhucyt.oas.org/presentationsSH/presentationCRMarch01.pdf.

Growth in the number of personal computers is also strong, according to IDC Latin America, a telecommunications and information technology (IT) research firm, although their use varies from country to country.²⁴

Working toward universal access is an important goal within each LAC country. In Peru and Mexico, programs in support of cybercafes, *telecentros*, or other types of points of access to the Internet that are low cost and open to the public have made inroads in universal access. Decreased cost of Internet access has facilitated the development of cybercafes in these countries. In contrast, the high cost of access in Colombia has made it much more difficult for cybercafes to take hold.²⁵

With increased connectivity and access come increased opportunities for taking advantage of learning via the Web. For those who doubt that the access issue can be overcome, Mr. Carlos Cruz, president of the Virtual University in Monterrey, Mexico, explains how for only \$6,000 a satellite connection was provided to a small town in Mexico that did not have a telephone, so that they could participate in distance education.²⁶ In a recent report on telecentros, the authors emphasized the significance of “non-wire” technology to the possibility of expanding access to the Internet. The authors also note that in the LAC region, “universal service” may not be realistic, but “universal access” through telecentros where Internet access is provided is feasible.²⁷

Most countries in Latin America are supporting greater access and connectivity to the Internet. Colombia, for example has a Presidential Plan for the Development of ICTs which is published on the national Web site, www.agenda.gov.co. This plan, based on the Presidential Decree #2719, created a Connectivity Agenda, which stresses the need for Colombians to take advantage of new ICTs to promote development, improve the quality of life, improve the state of the economy, and create new jobs, as well as modernize state processes and offer better service to citizens. Costa Rica is offering a free e-mail account to every citizen through its Web site, www.costarricense.com, as a way to encourage individuals to become more Internet savvy.

In Mexico, the *Sistema e-Mexico* (www.e-mexico.gob.mx) aims to facilitate access to many citizen services, including health, education, and commerce, and offers a variety of online transactions. The program hopes to connect all 2,428 municipalities to the Internet via digital community centers, educational and health centers, and post office and telegraph networks, among others. To date, the program has connected over 200 municipalities to the Internet.

²⁴ www.idc.com/idcla/whatsnew/PCQ2092101.htm.

²⁵ Proenza, F. Bastidas-Buch, R., Montero, G. “Telecentros para el desarrollo socioeconómico y rural en America Latina y el Caribe.” Feb. 2001. Washington, DC.

²⁶ www.iadb.org/idbamerica/English/MAY01E/may01e3-d.html.

²⁷ www.iadb.org/regions/telecentros/index.htm. Proenza F., Bastidas-Buch R., Montero G. *Telecentros para el desarrollo socioeconómico y rural en America Latina y el Caribe*, February 2001.

E-Commerce in Ecuador

Organizations such as the Ecuadorian Corporation for Electronic Commerce (*La Corporación Ecuatoriana de Comercio Electrónico*, www.corpece.org.ec), established in December 1998, work to promote the use of the Internet for commercial means and to encourage e-business as a model for conducting business with the assistance of information technology, the Internet, and telecommunications.

CORPECE is linked to a broad multinational support organization, the Pan-American Union of Associations of Engineers (www.upadi.org), which brings together more than 2.3 million engineers through its membership of 27 associations from countries including Argentina, Mexico, Cuba, Chile, Puerto Rico, the United States, Canada, and Spain. CORPECE was established in response to a proposal from UPADI to create a regional initiative on e-business.

Dues-paying members of CORPECE include businesses that provide services related to e-business and the Internet, telecommunications providers, businesses that use Internet technology, the public sector, state bodies, and international organizations.

CORPECE works to provide dialogue and information on Internet issues at one level to the general public, and in more detail to its members, who set the organization's agenda. CORPECE also encourages the state to provide infrastructure and regulatory support to facilitate the development of Internet applications in Ecuador. The government has moved forward with its commitment to connectivity by organizing a National Commission of Connectivity, which met in November 2001.

CORPECE, UPADI, and organizations with similar goals and activities are important resources and potential support organizations for e-learning and other Internet-based initiatives.

Do Not Repeat "Bad Habits" of Traditional Training

The literature regarding e-learning stresses the following: if bad traditional training is converted to an electronic format it is still bad and ineffective training. Below we have highlighted some requirements for providing good quality training, whether via the Internet or in a more traditional format.

Perform Needs Assessment

The first step in the preparation of any training program is to conduct a needs assessment. Too often the needs assessment phase is completely skipped, and "experts" conduct training on what they believe the participants need to know without checking what they already know or what is the greatest need. Those hiring training firms or organizations often want to skip the needs assessment to save time or money, but in actuality they only do themselves and their target audience a disservice by leaving out a crucial part of the process.

In cases where training developers perform a needs assessment, sometimes the assessment is simply a written survey, which may not be the best choice. Given that learners sometimes "do not know what they do not know" and that job performance is key, observing a sample of the training audience "on the job" can be of great assistance in planning training. On-the-job analysis can be conducted in several ways, including participation in meetings, observations at

work, and careful job and task analyses that require the observer to closely observe and analyze the way particular tasks are currently done. Training developers can also assess needs by using work and organizational documents, focus groups, and one-on-one interviews.

Annex C provides an overview of various techniques for performing needs assessments. There are many more training, learning, and performance resources that provide much more detail about this essential training skill.²⁸ It is critical that needs assessments be incorporated into the design of training programs, as they can help in making them more demand-driven, in contrast to the supply-side training programs developed by training providers in most countries, programs that are very often developed without taking into account the actual needs of the individuals they are supposed to assist.

The needs assessment can be conducted by various people. Supervisors are able to conduct one by observing and monitoring the performance of their staff. The training provider can also conduct a needs assessment through various methods depending on the time and resources available. These methods can include interviews with supervisors, observation of staff on the job, and interviews with staff in person or by phone. The trainer then uses the needs assessment to shape the actual learning event or resource provided to the target audience.

Even if a thorough needs assessment is not feasible, a highly skilled trainer will seek out ways to conduct a needs assessment that include direct contact with the participants. In a worst-case scenario, the trainer can conduct the assessment at the beginning of a training program on-site. For courses that will be repeated, each session provides an opportunity to refine the course through input and feedback of the current participants.

At the individual level, when a person knows the skills needed to perform a specific job or task, s/he may “self-assess” and determine that he or she needs additional training. In the fast-changing world of work today, the era of “continual improvement” or “lifelong learning” is increasingly accepted as the norm. Individuals who are interested in upgrading their employment or increasing their skills to receive an increase in pay or benefits may seek out and enroll in training.

Provide Incentives to Learning

The need for motivation is repeated again and again throughout training literature. This fact is even more relevant when training adults. Adults have a multitude of worries, responsibilities, and priorities to achieve. In order for adult students to learn, the training content must be relevant to them and it must benefit them.

Training providers must take the characteristics of adult learners into account for traditional classroom training as well as online learning. Often, those involved in training adults approach the training in the same way as they would approach an educational course for young learners (children). Given the way that adults learn, this is a grave error.

²⁸ See the American Society for Training and Development (www.astd.org) or HRDQ On-line (www.hrdq.com) for some initial references.

Adults learn:

- What they want to learn.
- What they feel a need to learn.
- If information is practical and realistic.
- By doing.

Adults learn best when:

- They are active, not passive.
- The goals and objectives are clear.
- The learning atmosphere is comfortable and informal.
- Information is applied to their experience.
- They agree what is taught will help them do a better job.
- A variety of methods are used.
- They are challenged and encouraged (not embarrassed or downgraded).

Malcolm Knowles brought the concept of the adult learner into the field of learning. He coined the phrase andragogy, which refers to the art and science of helping adults learn, as opposed to pedagogy, which refers to helping children learn. Considering some characteristics of adult learners in contrast to young learners further clarifies the importance of recognizing the difference.

Table 4: Characteristics of Pedagogy vs. Andragogy

Pedagogy (Young Learners)	Andragogy (Adult Learners)
Captive audience	Voluntary learners
Subject-centered	Problem-centered
Dependent learners	Independent learners
Inexperienced	Experienced
Teachers prescribe content	Learners decide content
Grouped by age/level/ability	Grouped by interest/need
Concerned with learning for the future	Concerned with using knowledge now
View learning as terminal	View learning as a lifelong process
Subordinate to the teacher	Equal to the teacher/trainer

Neither the topic nor the method used to create the learning experience matters: if the adult learner is not motivated, performance will not improve. Think of yourself – what motivates you to seek out learning opportunities to improve your job performance? Is it the potential for promotion, recognition, better compensation, more effective and up-to-date performance, or because the training is mandatory? Adults need to know what the benefit will be for them so that they will be motivated to participate in the training, absorb the content, and improve their skills.

Set Performance Standards

The difference between the current level of performance and the desired level is the performance gap. Training and learning opportunities need to be focused on closing this gap. For training to be successful, training providers must identify this gap and articulate it in specific terms related to skills and knowledge.

In the context of local government staff and elected officials in Latin America and the Caribbean, governments must establish standards of performance and norms to measure the gap between desired and actual performance. Governments must identify these standards of performance both at the macro level of the local government as well as the micro level of each job performed within a specific local government.

At the macro level, good practices that lead to positive management improvements in a group of local governments should be shared with others. As local governments throughout the region gain experience and competence with increased decentralization, good practices will emerge, trends will be established, and lessons will be learned. It is crucial that local governments document and share successes so that they may identify performance standards as benchmarks to which those interested in improving performance can compare their operation.

Donor organizations wishing to help promote higher performance standards may want to consider programs to recognize local governments that have met or seek to meet agreed-upon standards. This type of award or recognition program, undertaken perhaps with national or regional municipal associations, can be a first step in heightening awareness about international standards. While such programs are not directly e-learning, e-learning will not thrive in an environment where people are not seeking out and participating in training or other activities that improve their performance. And people (staff, elected officials) will not seek out those opportunities if they do not know how that effort will benefit them.

At the micro level, local government leaders and managers who are striving to improve the overall professionalism in their municipalities must be aware of the need to improve the performance of each staff member and to make learning opportunities available. They also need to be willing to tie improved performance to some kind of reward—increased pay, recognition, or promotion. At the same time, rewards unrelated to performance (including patronage and nepotism) must be eliminated in order for performance rewards to be effective. Managers dedicated to improving staff performance should seek out programs that are likely to close the gap between actual and desired performance.

Measure the Impact of Training

The ability to measure the impact of training on the overall organization and its performance is the highest level of evaluation possible. Within the corporate environment, this means that the organization needs to measure the impact on bottom line profits. For a local government, measurements may consider the efficiency and effectiveness of how public services are provided.

There are four standard levels of evaluation in training and learning programs. The basic model of the four levels was developed by Donald Fitzpatrick in 1959. The vast majority of evaluations

continue to be based on this model. Author William Horton states that this four-tier framework is applicable to e-learning as well.²⁹

Table 5: Kirkpatrick’s Classic Four Levels of Evaluation

Level of Evaluation		What it Measures
4	Results	How well did the organization meet its business goals? Was the result profitable?
3	Performance	How much is job performance improved? What can learners apply to their jobs?
2	Learning	What skills and knowledge did they acquire?
1	Response	Did learners like the training? Did they complete it?

Source: Horton, William. *Evaluating E-Learning*. American Society for Training and Development. 2001.

For the vast majority of training events, trainers only conduct a Level One evaluation. They ask participants to evaluate the training very close to the conclusion of the training. What is captured is participants’ immediate response to the training – how they think and feel the training met their perceived needs. Level One evaluations are relatively easy to conduct, which is probably why they are more often completed.

Each level of evaluation is progressively more difficult to conduct. Level Two evaluations look at what the participants actually learned. This type of evaluation often takes place immediately following the learning activity, which may not actually be the best time to conduct it. To really see if learning took place it is more beneficial to measure learning some time after the training event – perhaps six weeks.

Level Three evaluations, which measure whether performance has improved, should take place after participants have had an opportunity to apply what they learned on the job. Level Three evaluations can include observation of on-the-job behavior, opinions of those who can rate the worker’s performance, job performance records, and controlled tests of work output.³⁰ Training organizations polled by ASTD about evaluations conducted reported that only about 17 percent of all courses offered include a performance survey.

Level Four evaluations, which look at the business impact of training, are the most difficult to conduct because there are always other factors that impact the business (or local government) performance in addition to the training. Fewer than 10 percent of all courses offered have a Level Four evaluation.³¹ To conduct this type of evaluation there has to be a way to show return on investment of the training. The return on investment alone, however, could be misleading due to other non-quantifiable benefits that result from training. Therefore, trainers must use this type of analysis with caution.

Evaluation should seek to identify hard benefits, such as direct cost savings, production increases (or improved efficiency), time savings, quality improvement; soft benefits, such as

²⁹ Horton, William. *Evaluating E-Learning*. American Society for Training and Development. 2001.

³⁰ Ibid. p. 43.

³¹ Ibid. p. 10.

improvements in work performance, innovation and creativity, work environment enhancements, and career advancement; and “fuzzy” benefits, such as employee satisfaction and happiness, initiative and leadership, and basic business skills.³²

Mr. Horton’s book, mentioned above, gives detailed suggestions regarding how each of these types of evaluation can be applied to e-learning.

What steps are needed to address the existing gap in training while promoting e-learning?

Establish Performance Standards for Municipalities and Municipal Officials

Municipalities in Latin America have had limited success in developing strong and sustainable management structures. Mayors name their department heads, usually based on political affiliation. Since these individuals are rarely professionals, the departments remain disorganized, and most lack operational policies and procedures. While the staff may receive training during the term of the mayor, which may lead to some improvements, the institution-building cycle starts again with the new election, never reaching a point where the incoming administration is able to start at a higher level of efficiency and effectiveness.

Short of engaging in a lengthy and often controversial process of civil service reform, international organizations and technical cooperation agencies can promote certification of municipal officials as a way to help build a solid management foundation at the municipal level. In addition to promoting standards in different areas of management, certification can create a pool of qualified, effective professionals from which newly elected mayors will be able to draw when setting up their administrations.

Should international organizations decide to invest resources in promoting certification and in providing the training necessary to create a cadre of professionals for municipalities, they must also ensure that these efforts will actually improve the performance of municipalities. In addition to setting performance standards, policy changes must occur within national governments so that incentives are created for those municipalities that meet these standards. Certification must be accompanied by a system of incentives or disincentives for it to be attractive to local governments that will be hiring certified staff.

Once standards have been established in different areas of municipal management, trainers can develop courses to address the skills and knowledge identified as essential for each area of management. If standards are set nationwide, then courses should also be fairly standardized, making widespread dissemination of these courses less costly (perhaps through training of trainers programs).

Perform a Diagnostic of Current Training Practices by Country

While there is a lot of training occurring in Latin America, few organizations have been able to catalogue the type of training that is occurring, the methodologies used, and the effectiveness of those methodologies. The International City/County Management Association (ICMA)

³² Ibid. pp. 70-71.

conducted a training diagnostic in Bolivia in 1999 which revealed that the greatest obstacles to effective training often stem from the lack of a clear understanding of the actual training priorities at the local level; redundant and irrelevant efforts; and perhaps more importantly, the absence of due consultation and participation of key actors and sources in the definition of programs and contents.³³ What the diagnostic clearly showed was that despite the diverse approaches and methodologies applied, there is still lack of documented and tested models that could become sustainable channels for effective training delivery mechanisms and enhanced information and communication technologies.

Municipal associations are particularly well positioned to help bridge the gap between the massive need for training of elected and appointed officials and the current supply of training since they understand the needs of municipal officials and often act as facilitators of training opportunities. E-Learning is one of the keys to helping bridge that gap. Several initiatives are being discussed to help these associations develop and refine this potential role, which would help eliminate duplication in training, prevent resources from being spent on bad training programs, and create within each country a roster of training programs in the different areas of local government management from which municipalities could choose. Combined with a nationwide effort to provide certification of certain municipal employees and functions, this could be a powerful tool at the disposal of municipalities. Associations would not have to give their approval of certain training programs over others, but rather establish standardized criteria that would help municipalities make informed decisions about the training they would be purchasing.

E-Learning fits in particularly well within this scheme since it does provide a more standardized methodology where the kind of information provided is not wholly dependent on the trainer's capabilities. Many good quality training programs already exist and are being taught traditionally, but with further investment, these programs could be offered via electronic means (synchronous and asynchronous).

Provide Performance Support Through Knowledge Management

For countries where certification may not be possible in the short run but where training resources are scarce and the need for training opportunities high, knowledge management is a good option for providing municipal staff with a written "institutional memory" and ensuring that lessons learned during one period are not lost for those who follow. Information, as well as courses made available via the Internet, may be able to mitigate some of the management problems related to high turnover.

Local governments in Latin America and the Caribbean might apply knowledge management within a country through a system that catalogs all updates on the laws pertaining to local government, with commentary and examples of problem resolution. The local government

³³ ICMA, with the collaboration of IULA/CELCADEL (*Unión Internacional de Autoridades Locales/Centro de Capacitación y Desarrollo de los Gobiernos Locales*) and CEPAD (*Centro para la Participación y el Desarrollo Humano Sostenible*) devised a comprehensive methodology to perform a diagnostic of the supply and demand of training in Bolivia in six key areas: municipal institutional development, local economic development, planning, citizen participation, environmental management, and regional associations. The diagnostic is available online at: www.lacforum.org/library/bolivia.

association or a knowledgeable entity might manage such a site – gathering information from the central government and examples of applications from local governments, and making them easily accessible to all others. Or, local governments can themselves provide information on the Internet regarding changes in procedures, contact information, how to fill out certain forms, how to respond to specific questions from citizens, etc. Many municipal associations throughout Latin America are already doing this, at varying degrees of complexity and inter-activity.

At a regional level, knowledge management could perhaps be applied by collecting and disseminating concrete information about training available to local governments both on- and offline. This knowledge management is complementary to the previous section's recommendation that municipal associations develop a roster of training opportunities for their members. Rosenberg states that, "Knowledge management supports the creation, archiving, and sharing of valued information, expertise, and insight within and across communities of people and organizations with similar interests and needs."³⁴ Local governments throughout the region face similar issues. Staff are required to have many specific skills, regardless of the country. Therefore, there may be some advantage to compiling and sharing information, but it is essential that the information be relevant and updated. In addition to cataloging ongoing courses available, there could be a way for training participants to include their specific comments about a course so that others can get not only course information but also personal recommendations regarding what is offered.

Again, the key to knowledge management is that the information should be useful to the community of learners and that there are mechanisms to ensure that the information provided is kept up to date.

What can donors/international cooperation agencies do to promote e-learning programs in LAC?

E-government—the provision of local government services to the community 24 hours a day, seven days a week—is a phenomenon new even in the United States. More and more information is being provided via the Internet, and universal access is clearly a necessity. In a recent survey conducted by ICMA in the United States, more than 80 percent of local governments responding have a Web site, and just over half use the Internet for procurement. At this point few are actually providing services online; however, the trend is in the direction of more services on the Web.³⁵

The Inter-American Development Bank distinguishes between e-government, which it describes as "the ability to obtain government services through nontraditional electronic means, enabling access to government information and to completion of government transactions on an anywhere, any time basis..." and e-governance, which it defines as a tool to enable "direct

³⁴ Rosenberg, Marc J. *E-Learning Strategies for Delivering Knowledge in the Digital Age*, McGraw Hill. 2001. p. 66.

³⁵ For more details go to: icma.org/download/cat15/grp120/sgp224/E-Gov2000.pdf.

participation of constituents in government activities... [and to] allow citizens to participate in the government decision-making process..."³⁶

Support for e-government in LAC by donor organizations and technical cooperation agencies can help give municipalities and their staff the ability to take advantage of e-learning opportunities. First, it is important to promote some type of electronic government, no matter how simple, to enable a culture of technology to develop within a municipality. Once that culture is established, both municipal staff and ordinary citizens will have greater ability to influence decision making within their governments. Once individuals become more familiar with the Internet at the municipal level – through a municipal Web site or portal that provides information and services, for example – they are also likely to feel more comfortable with using the Internet to enhance their skills or knowledge. Once they use the Internet to enhance their skills, they can also participate more actively in e-governance activities.

What can donor organizations/technical cooperation agencies do? To support e-learning for local government in LAC, donors should:

- Encourage connectivity
- Leverage existing e-learning resources
- Promote quality learning programs.

Encourage Connectivity

Access to the Internet

The costs of access via satellite are coming down. As telecommunications are decentralized, telephone access also tends to fall in price. National governments need to support these trends and develop complementary programs that will provide greater access to the Internet for municipalities, in particular those that are more rural or further removed from large urban centers. Donors should support and encourage national governments to do this.

At the same time, technical assistance is needed – especially in rural areas and smaller municipalities – to help negotiate the terms of connectivity agreements and the accompanying package of services. At times, collaboration among several potential recipients could result in stronger “buying power” and cost savings. In larger cities there tend to be resources available to help with these decisions. Donors can support this technical assistance by leveraging existing programs such as the Geekcorps (www.geekcorps.org) or by developing other programs (perhaps through municipal associations) that give decision makers access to the options and technical advice needed to make sound decisions regarding Internet access.

Interoperability

Donors can help ensure that technology investments are compatible with future trends and needs. Various products developed by different vendors often have incompatible operating systems. Organizations that are at the beginning of the process can avoid costly mistakes by learning from the experience of others.

³⁶ www.iadb.org/ict4-dev/.

E-Learning industry standards are emerging. Today, many Web sites are written in HTML (Hypertext Markup Language), but XML (Extensible Markup Language) is more flexible and should help accelerate the standards work.³⁷ For further information, consult some key groups making progress in the area of e-learning standards:

- Airline Industry CBT Committee (AICC) focuses on standards for online training (e.g., tests, lessons, modules) (www.aicc.org).
- EDUCAUSE Instructional Management Systems (IMS) Project is working to develop a set of tags that can be used to define each component of an e-learning environment (www.imsproject.org).
- Advanced Distributed Learning (ADL) is a federal government initiative working on the standards issue (www.adlnet.org).

For additional resources and more details on this issue see Rosenberg.³⁸

Leverage Existing Resources and Programs

Public-Private Partnerships

Donors can encourage local development of e-learning capacities by supporting new alliances among trainers, technology firms, local government practitioners, educators and researchers, and others interested in local government capacity building. To date, much e-learning has emanated from a collaboration between universities and the private sector.

Donors and local government associations should seek out distance education programs in their own country, become familiar with the most successful programs, and look for ways to collaborate. It appears that in most countries throughout LAC, some progress has been made in the area of e-learning, and this progress should be harnessed for application to local government.

Use, Adapt, and Enhance Existing Programs

As one example, the International Institute of Governance in Spain offers an online master's program in Local Government and Development. Many of the course topics appear general enough to be applicable in various countries. If local organizations – associations, schools, or others – in each country worked in cooperation with the Institute and provided a few key supplemental courses (i.e., in legal systems, finance, and administration), local participants could benefit from the program and, with limited investment, the local organization would add value for its constituents. Donors can support this kind of cooperation.

Market E-Learning Programs

George Mitch, vice-president for organizational development and quality management at UniGroup (parent company of United Van Lines and Mayflower Transit) emphasizes that companies cannot assume that the world is waiting for online training. His company sends out

³⁷ Rosenberg, Marc J. *E-Learning Strategies for Delivering Knowledge in the Digital Age*, McGraw Hill. 2001. pp. 169-170.

³⁸ Ibid. p. 151-177.

posters and e-mail messages to remind employees of their program's existence.³⁹ Organizations that support e-learning programs should include marketing to the target audience to encourage use of the programs. The key, however, is that e-learning programs must be of excellent quality so that learners are not discouraged after their first e-learning experience.

Internships

Local government training providers, consultants, and practitioners in LAC can learn from universities and the private sector in the region that are already using e-learning and distance education technology. Donors could facilitate and finance internships that would provide opportunities to transfer knowledge to the local government sector.

Take Advantage of Cost Savings If Possible

If local governments do not commit significant funds for training their staff internally or for their officials and staff to seek training externally, the discussion of cost savings as it has taken place within corporate America is not very relevant. You cannot decrease spending when spending is not taking place and when the organizational culture does not support training and learning programs in the first place.

Donor organizations, national governments, and individual local governments that are already investing significant sums in training programs can take advantage of e-learning in the same way that corporations have and decrease the per person training cost—especially over the long term.

Promote High Quality Learning Programs

Ensure Focus on the Learning and Not the Technology

In many countries, the rush to get educational and training programs online has tended to emphasize use of the technology, thereby losing sight of the learning. Donors that want to support e-learning initiatives should ensure that programs and projects emphasize the learning that will take place rather than the means of delivery. Both are important, but if emphasis is on the technology, the learning goal can be lost.

Support Programs That Increase Skills Related to the Adult Learner

In order to make sure that a move to e-learning does not simply move educational or academic programs online or transfer mediocre training programs online, improved skills in the area of adult learning are needed—especially among those who provide training to adults. Often in LAC, university professors accustomed to a traditional school environment are the same people who become trainers. For them, it is probably the most difficult transition to make. Trainers that come from a practitioner perspective may find it easier to work with adults in a framework that is practical and immediately applicable. All trainers of adults should learn the basic skills of teaching adult learners.

³⁹ *On-line Learning Magazine*, May 2001, "A Smooth Move" by Joel Hoeksra.

Encourage Local Government Associations To Improve Their Knowledge Management Capacity

Local government associations, in cooperation with universities and high technology companies, should engage in activities that allow them to improve their knowledge management capabilities with careful emphasis on content for learning. Content should not only be focused on offering full courses online, but also on providing a myriad of learning objects and modules.

Putting together and managing databases for knowledge management gives the association staff experience relevant to learning online. At the same time, members become more comfortable using technology as they access information via the Internet. Donor organizations should support local government associations as they develop their knowledge management capabilities and market the new services to their members.

The international donor community should launch pilot programs to use e-learning in municipalities that have already made strides in improving their overall administration, including motivating learners through merit-based rewards for good performance. These programs could be directly linked to merit systems already in place.

Get Involved in the Topic

Donors should support institutions and events that promote information sharing about e-learning technology. Moreover, they should participate in events that focus on the topic of technology and applications to e-learning, including those of professional societies and organizations that specialize in the topic. Staff of donor organizations should consider taking a course online to familiarize themselves with how the technology works.

Conclusion

This paper only scratches the surface of the topic of e-learning, which is changing as fast as the technology that makes it possible. Similarly, the recommendations above are just a sample of what the international donor community can do to promote the greater development and use of e-learning throughout the LAC region. Through the task force on e-learning being organized through the Forum for Cooperation on Local Government in Latin America and the Caribbean, we would like to refine and expand the list of recommendations. It is important to remember, however, that international organizations, multilateral banks, and national governments are not the only institutions that provide assistance to strengthen local governments and the skills of their officials and staff. Many other key players are involved, such as NGOs (including municipal associations), foundations, the private sector, educational institutions, and others. They must be considered as partners as we discuss this topic and its implications for improving the performance of municipal governments in LAC. We look forward to your input and participation in this process.

Resources

These resources list various sites that include information relevant to this discussion paper. Some have been drawn upon in the paper; if so, references are noted in the footnotes above. Others are included here as additional resources.

The resources are listed in three sections:

- Training and E-Learning
- Latin America and the Caribbean
 - o E-Learning and Technology Related
 - o General Information and Databases
- Development Programs Related to E-Learning

General Training and E-Learning

www.learningcircuits.org/glossary.html

The E-Learning Glossary of the American Society for Training and Development (ASTD), a professional membership organization of training and human development professionals.

www.astd.org/virtual_community/public_policy/jh_ver.pdf

"A Vision of E-Learning for America's Workforce." This paper is a must read for anyone who is interested in an overview of e-learning and where it is going in the U.S.

www.elearningmag.com

Key publication regarding distance education.

www.brandon-hall.com

Leading "think tank" regarding e-learning.

www.elearningphoenix.edu

One of the leaders in online learning, a private university.

www.knowledgeplanet.com

Software for e-learning and human resource management.

www.IBM.com/mindspan

Example of corporate use of the Internet for employee training globally.

www.isoc.org

The Internet Society is an international, non-profit organization dedicated to being the "Who's Who" of the Internet world. The work of the Internet Society focuses on four "pillars:" standards, public policy, education and training, and membership.

dlcoursefinder.com

The International Distanced Learning Course Finder is a directory of e-learning courses from 130 countries and carries information about 55,000 programs. It claims to be the largest such search engine.

www.informationweek.com/767/learn.htm

Article regarding distance learning by corporation, while somewhat dated (2000), gives sense of the extent to which e-learning will be applied.

www.petersons.com/dlearn/select/x4se.html

Lists more than 150 master's level programs in the U.S. that are 100 percent distance education.

usdla.org

United States Distance Learning Association, dedicated to supporting distance learning, has more than 3,000 members from throughout the education and training industry.

www1.worldbank.org/disted/home.html

World Bank's distance education site set up to assist those interested in preparing distance education. Provides an overview of technology options and includes general information on how to prepare a course. Tends to be a bit academic, and references are somewhat out of date.

idg.net

International Data Group (IDG) is the world's leading IT media, research, and exposition company. Founded in 1964, IDG had 2000 revenues of \$3.1 billion and has more than 12,000 employees worldwide. IDG offers the widest range of media options, which reach 90 million IT buyers in 85 countries representing 95 percent of worldwide IT spending.

www.telelearn.ca

Canada's distance education think tank. Includes research regarding the cost-benefit analysis of e-learning.

www.city.grande-prairie.ab.ca/ccy_el.htm#EL_Index

An index of e-learning resources, which includes a long list of links to Web sites, articles, and papers on the topic. List is organized into four sections: (1) introductory and background articles, (2) commentaries on strategy, management and policy, institutes, centers, (3) research projects, and (4) papers and articles at consultancies.

www.apexlearning.com/

Apex Learning focuses on K-12 education via the Internet in the U.S.

www.icde.org/

The International Council for Open and Distance Education, founded in 1938, is a global membership organization dedicated to the promotion of open learning, distance education, and flexible, lifelong learning. The Web site has some academic papers and information about international conferences that the organization has held.

www.neccsite.org/html/neca_cooperating_societies.html

The National Educational Computing Association provides a list of and links to a number of U.S.-based associations focused on “technology in education.”

www.outreach.utk.edu/weblearning

Hosted by Robert H. Jackson, recipient of the 2001 Dell Computer Star Grant. Mr. Jackson is studying advanced learning management systems and their future role in collaborative partnerships among universities, governmental organizations, and private industry. The Web site contains many definitions and links related to e-learning.

Latin America and the Caribbean

E-Learning and Technology Related

www.redhucyt.oas.org/webing/WEB6.HTM

Hemisphere-wide inter-university scientific and technological information network. Includes information regarding use and penetration of the Internet in Latin America and the Caribbean.

www.redhucyt.oas.org/presentationsSH/presentationCRMarch01.pdf

Slide presentation with information regarding penetration of Internet, telephones, and personal computers in Latin America and the Caribbean.

www.isoc.org/isoc/conferences/inet/00/cdproceedings/8d/8d_5.htm

Series of case studies on the development of the Internet in Latin American and the Caribbean by Saul Hahn of the IDB. Related to the Redhucyt project.

www.cytcd.org/Nueva.asp

Ciencia y tecnología para el desarrollo.

www.iigov.org

El Instituto Internacional de Gobernabilidad, en su Escuela Virtual de Gobernabilidad, ofrece un “Master en Gobierno y Desarrollo Local.”

lib.nmsu.edu/subject/bord/laguia

Multitude of links to news resources, libraries, and research in or about Latin America from the New Mexico State University.

lanic.utexas.edu/la/region/distance/

Links to distance education programs throughout the region organized by country from the University of Texas at Austin.

lanic.utexas.edu/projects/tilan/

This section, Trends in Latin American Networking, includes summary information by country about communication resources (telephone, Internet, newspaper, etc.) and links to Internet and telecommunication information.

www.contenidos.com/bitacora/opinion.php3

Paper, in Spanish, regarding the value of distance education, by Maria Ana Dillon.

www.isoc.org/isoc/conferences/inet/99/proceedings/2e/2e_2.htm

Comparative study of the development of primary and secondary school networks for distance education in Mexico, Chile, Argentina, and Brazil.

www.contenidos.com/proyecto.htm

Lists distance education courses offered, as well as other information.

www.contenidos.com/educacion/presentacion/presentacion.php?CURSO=2&ORIGEN

Specific course offered about how to use the Internet for training/teaching. (Spanish)

www.contenidos.com/quienes.htm

In Argentina, ten businesses recognized by the Ministry of Education to provide distance learning (*capacitación a distancia*).

www.ave.edu.co/info/servi/servi.htm

Distance education for primary and secondary school in Colombia (in Spanish).

www.uned.es/aiesad

La Asociación Iberoamericana de Educación Superior a Distancia (AIESAD) (Iberoamerican Association of Higher Education at a Distance) es una entidad sin ánimo de lucro, cuya creación deriva de la resolución adoptada durante el I Simposio Iberoamericano de Rectores de Universidades Abiertas, reunidos en Madrid del 5 al 10 de Octubre de 1980, quienes para impulsar la Educación Superior a Distancia en beneficio de los pueblos de Iberoamérica, consideraron conveniente crear un mecanismo permanente de información, coordinación y cooperación: la AIESAD.

www.uned.es/aiesad/DIRECTORIO.htm

Membership directory of the Iberoamerican Association of Higher Education at a Distance.

la.idc.com

Latin America research division of IDG. Has press announcements available online. Research is available for a fee. Includes such topics as e-learning in Brazil (Cost of one document is \$4,500).

www.bnamericas.com

Business News Americas. Contains current information regarding technology investments in the region.

www.acs-aec.org/primus1.html

Provides overview of connectivity issues in the Caribbean. Paper prepared by Wilma J. Primus for the Secretariat of the Association of Caribbean States entitled, "Preliminary Status Report on Information and communications Technology (ICT) Infrastructure in the ACS States." June 1998.

www.isoc.org/INET97/proceedings/E2/E2_2.HTM#s2

Example of use of Internet to promote social and economic development from Recife, Brazil. Report from 1997 regarding the "Citizens' Network of the Municipality of Recife, Brazil: Lessons from the First Latin American Freenet."

General Information and Databases

www.library.cornell.edu/colldev/

Links to government statistic sources in LAC countries.

www.fiu.edu/~library/govdocs/intlac.html

Florida International University's library of international documents about Latin America and the Caribbean. Includes links to other sites.

www.georgetown.edu/pdba/

Political database of the Americas contains legal documents and election results from around the LAC region. Focused primarily on national politics but has some local information. Collaborative effort between Georgetown University and the Organization of American States.

Development Sites with Related Information

www.worldbank.org/wdr/2000/pdfs/tableA.1.pdf

From the *World Bank Development Report*, figures on decentralization including number of local units of government.

www.developmentgateway.org/node/100647/

Portal to information regarding development programs around the world.

www.infodev.org/about/other.htm

Lists some programs by multilateral and bilateral organizations that provide assistance with technology and networking programs.

learnlink.aed.org/HomeFrame/HomeFrame_01_01_04_01.htm?0001

Paper regarding the implementation of e-learning in Benin. Describes how the technological barriers are overcome and how the community can benefit from *extensive* information available once online. This is a LearnLink project supported by USAID.

www.amideast.org/publications/aq/Modelpage1e.htm

Publication, *The Advising Quarterly*, has many articles and links regarding distance education and e-learning. Published by Amideast. Articles not limited to the Middle East.

ANNEX A

U.S. Examples of E-Learning Initiatives

Corporate E-Learning Provision with Application to Local Government

Primedia Workplace Learning, Texas (www.pwpl.com)

Primedia Workplace Learning specializes in providing industry-specific education, information, and training to dozens of industries worldwide. The high quality content Primedia Workplace Learning programs enable participants to fulfill federal and state-mandated training requirements and continuing education requirements, and to earn college graduate-level credit. The company delivers products to approximately 9,000 subscribing organizations and many more individual professionals.

The company creates approximately 200 hours of original programming every month and has over 125,000 archived programs in its library. The company delivers products to 25,000 subscribers monthly, as well as an estimated three million professionals and students. All programming is produced for delivery to specialized audiences, and about 95 percent of Primedia's programming is created in-house.

The consulting arm of Primedia Workplace Learning conducts workplace needs assessments and, in cooperation with the company's instructional design experts and content providers, continuously produces new programs for an ever-widening list of established and emerging industries. Throughout the process, Primedia staff work in conjunction with leading industry authorities, government agencies, and some major universities across the United States and abroad.

Primedia employs a wide array of technologies to deliver its programming, including satellite, video, print, videoconferencing, CD-ROM, and desktop workstation, and provides training programs include automotive, financial services, health care, government services, and industrial services. What follows are short descriptions of two of Primedia's distance learning programs most relevant to local government in the United States: the Fire and Emergency Television Network (FETN) and the Law Enforcement Television Network (LETN).

Fire and Emergency Television Network/FETN (www.fetn.pwpl.com)
Primedia Workplace Learning (www.pwpl.com)

FETN produces training programs for fire, rescue, medical, and industrial emergency response teams and delivers the information via satellite broadcast and videotape to subscribing volunteer and municipal agencies, industrial facilities, and military installations. Training and educational programming is provided 16 hours a day, seven days a week.

FETN designs programming for each audience within the fire and emergency service such as frontline firefighters, driver/operators, emergency medical personnel, and chief/command officers with programs suited to their specific emergency response assignments. The network allows small departments to receive training they otherwise could not afford, and all firefighters and paramedics benefit from seeing how other cities handle situations.

FETN's programming is curriculum-based, using standards developed by the National Fire Protection Association and training curricula established by Fire Protection Publications, International Fire Service Training Association (IFSTA), of Oklahoma State University.

More than 4,000 fire departments in all 50 states and seven Canadian provinces subscribe to FETN. In its eighth year, FETN produces 105 new shows each year and has 30,000 hours of film cataloged. To receive FETN by satellite, departments must pay \$4 a month multiplied by the number of firefighters in a department. There is a \$100 monthly minimum for smaller departments.

Testimonial:

- All 55 fire stations in Dallas, Texas, have implemented the FETN training program, reaching a total of 2,200 firefighters.
- The Texas State Association of Fire Fighters (TSAFF) recorded a 10 percent decrease in firefighter injuries in Dallas over the last seven years the program has been in place.
- The TSAFF reported that the annual per station average cost of training in 1998⁴⁰ was roughly \$50,000 per year. That same year in Dallas, the firefighter training budget was over \$2.5 million. With FETN's training program, the Dallas fire district, which includes all 55 stations, saved 65 percent on its classroom training expenses.⁴¹
- Ray F. Reed, the president of the Dallas Fire Fighters Association-Local 58, said: "The FETN program has provided an enormous amount of flexibility to the guys in the station houses around the city. Now a guy who works the night shift (8:00 PM to 8:00 AM) can do his classroom training during his shift rather than having to come in on overtime during his day off. The quality of the program is also just as good and sometimes better than what was given in the classroom."

Law Enforcement Television Network/LETN (www.letn.pwpl.com/html/index/htm)
Primedia Workplace Learning (www.pwpl.com)

LETN offers varied multimedia programming for police agencies, sheriff's departments, state police agencies, corrections departments, national police organizations, and federal agencies—including the FBI and National Highway Traffic Safety Administration.

The Law Enforcement Television Network began in 1989. Since then, LETN has become one of the most widely subscribed training networks for law enforcement in the country with over 2,000 sites and 150,000 officers participating in training daily.

The LETN network is versatile and allows customers a number of programming choices. LETN uses well-known experts from most venues of law enforcement and has a group of in-house

⁴⁰ TSAFF estimates based on the average station size of 40 full-time professional firefighters and a per firefighter cost of \$100 per month for training.

⁴¹ Training expenses are divided into two major categories: classroom and field training. The savings on classroom training was 65 percent, but 25 percent overall. The field training budget is proportionally higher than the classroom budget.

trainers. Course content is driven by staff law enforcement officers, instructional designers, television producers, and support staff.

LETN broadcasts training programs 24 hours a day, five days a week, over a private satellite network. Programs focus on providing timely training to the law enforcement community. The company also provides third party training documentation and testing through their Academy.

In addition to regular programming, LETN periodically produces courses designed to meet required or legislated state mandates, on topics ranging from “Cultural Diversity” to “Special Investigative Topics.” In each case, LETN receives approved provider status from the state law enforcement accrediting agency.

Testimonials:

- Captain Robert E. Carr, Charlotte County Sheriff’s Office: “We recently installed a fully operational STARR System in the county courthouse that permits our officers to receive training while waiting to be called to testify in court cases. Since these personnel are being paid while waiting to testify, they can accomplish necessary training at the same time. The concept has worked well and saved money.”
- Sgt. Michael Gardner, Cincinnati (Ohio) Police Division: “Though it is hard to measure what does not occur, I can assure you that our investment in LETN and more recently in the STARR System has saved our agency hundreds of thousands of dollars in litigation—and more importantly it has helped save lives. I am called upon frequently to testify in state and federal court regarding use-of-force issues, and having subscribed to LETN for 11 years now, I can tell you that my reference materials for testimony and expert witness opinions are rooted in LETN sources—both programming and personal contacts.”

Primedia Workplace Learning and the two examples above provide a glimpse at the power of providing learning opportunities through the Internet.

Local Government Application for Staff

NACo Internet University www.nacoiu.org/plm-cgi/plmweb.dll/login

The National Association of Counties of the U.S. has launched an impressive service for its members that is a good example for local government associations in LAC to consider when thinking about how they will provide services to their members via the Internet. The NACo Internet University provides access to hundreds of courses in two libraries: Internet technology (IT) and professional development. The NACo Internet University is a specialized service “uniquely dedicated to county officials and employees.”

All counties are eligible to participate in the Internet University by registering their staff and officials on a per-person basis. NACo members receive a discount. The per-person fee gives the registrant access to all courses in a specific library for one calendar year. Access is 24 hours a day, seven days a week. There is no limit to the number of courses that a person can take. Because the fee covers all courses in a library, the cost per course is very low for the county if a registrant takes advantage of the courses available. Also, the registrants have access to numerous skill-enhancing opportunities.

The Web site for the NACo Internet University provides basic information about e-learning, blended learning, tips for necessary equipment to take full advantage of the courses, and suggestions to management about creating an environment in which staff can take full advantage of the courses.

County officials have commented that they see the NACo Internet University as potentially most useful in rural areas that have limited access to training opportunities and as a way to enhance staff retention by providing training to staff in entry-level jobs, who often do not have extensive education, so that they can move up to other county jobs rather than seeking employment elsewhere. Likewise, the added benefit of training to entry-level workers will attract applicants to entry-level county jobs, which are often difficult to fill because salaries are lower than the private sector.

ANNEX B

LAC Examples of E-Learning Initiatives

The examples that follow are online professional development programs in Latin America. These programs have been successful in their country of origin, and some have begun to expand within the region, fueled by their success and the growing demand for e-learning opportunities.

Technological Institute of Higher Education of Monterrey (Mexico)

Eighty thousand (80,000) students throughout Mexico and Latin America have taken virtual courses offered by the Instituto Tecnológico de Estudios Superiores de Monterrey (ITESM).⁴² Most virtual courses use a combination of televised lectures (delivered live via satellite) and Internet-based resources. By 2005, the bulk of the school's virtual classes will use the Internet alone. Monterrey is planning to spend \$17 million on its online efforts during the next three years.⁴³

The ITESM offers undergraduate and graduate degrees through online courses as well as professional development and training programs through distance learning. The professional development offerings include a program for municipal government managers.⁴⁴

Monterrey Tech initiated its Virtual University ten years ago with start-up funding from the World Bank Institute (previously known as the Economic Development Institute). The university delivers courses via traditional and distance methods to its 28 regional campuses throughout Mexico and, more recently, has expanded to nine other countries in the region. The Virtual University's delivery mix includes one-way satellite fortified by real-time Internet-based communications between faculty and remote classrooms, as well as asynchronous interactions through the Web between students and faculty, among students, and with learning materials. Currently, the Institute's Virtual University has 1,429 receiving sites distributed throughout Mexico (1,302) and Spanish-speaking Latin America (127).

Monterrey Tech's Virtual University currently offers 15 different degree programs in business administration, engineering, technology, and education. The university is also expanding into non-degree in-service basic education training programs, which have already trained 750 public school principals in Panama and 5,300 teachers in seven countries across the region.

Monterrey Tech has leveraged its academic quality and expanding distance-education student populations to achieve substantive partnerships with several North American universities. ITESM and the Arizona-based Thunderbird School of International Management currently have 129 Latin American students enrolled in a joint MBA program, the first joint degree between a

⁴² The Web site of the Monterrey Institute's distance education program can be found at www.tec.com.mx/web/home/home/homeMs.htm.

⁴³ www.iadb.org/idbamerica/English/MAY01E/may01e3-d.html.

⁴⁴ Information about the *Seminario de Alta Administración Municipal* is located at www.ruv.itesm.mx/programas/seminarios.

Mexican and a U.S. university.⁴⁵ Students, located in Peru and throughout Mexico, are taught via one-way satellite and the Web with instruction originating from faculty in both Arizona and Monterrey.

ITESM also offers a joint certificate program in educational technology with a Canadian university, the University of British Columbia (U.B.C.), and has collaborated in team teaching, guest lectures, and other endeavors with a number of U.S. universities, among them Carnegie Mellon, Harvard, and the University of Texas at Austin.

When asked in an interview about the future of Internet education, Carlos Cruz, ITESM President, replied, "At ITESM we view this (satellite connection to the Internet) as an incredible opportunity to close the development gap. Our new mandate is to move beyond the corporate sector and form partnerships with small communities, governments, and educators who need continuing education." ITESM has already worked with a very small community that does not even have a phone line, Hidalgo, where the connection was provided via satellite.⁴⁶

Summary Data:

- *Training converted to e-learning:* Existing courses and curriculum were used to establish the bulk of the online learning curriculum at the Virtual University. The Virtual University also added courses in technology and technical training that were not previously offered via traditional methods.
- *Target audience:* College and graduate students throughout Latin America are taught through the courses at the Virtual University. The university is also serving professionals in the fields of education, municipal government, and business through non-degree certificate programs.
- *Training practices prior to e-learning:* The establishment of the Virtual University was Monterrey's first foray into e-learning vis-à-vis distance education. Prior to this, the university offered traditional university degrees in the sciences and liberal arts and in the traditional classroom/lecture format.
- *Purpose of training conversion:* Understanding the need to provide educational opportunities to busy people, the Virtual University was established to provide courses that were flexible in order to accommodate people who work full time. The university also saw an opportunity to use its well-known name as a traditional university in the region and capitalize on it by bringing the university to students who would not otherwise be able to travel to Mexico to study.

Instituto Tecnológico Superior (TECSUP), Peru

The Higher Technological Institute (TECSUP) in Peru is a private entity established in 1982 to provide technical and business education in order to increase the availability of qualified staff to private companies. TECSUP has campuses in Lima and Arequipa. The Institute's virtual campus, which was initiated in 1999, enables students to take courses at their convenience from

⁴⁵ www.t-bird.edu/xp/Thunderbird/academics/degrees_working_profess/mimla/.

⁴⁶ www.iadb.org/idbamerica/English/MAY01E/may01e3-d.html.

home, their workplace, TECSUP's facilities, or the public Internet kiosks that are rapidly becoming available throughout the country.

The Institute currently has 437 technical workers enrolled in the 38 different Internet training courses provided by TECSUP Virtual. More than 1,600 students have already completed virtual courses. Approximately 40 percent of TECSUP's distance continuing education students log into the campus network from work, 30 percent from public kiosks, and 20 percent from home. Roughly 40 percent of the students enrolled in the virtual campus are from Lima, and the remainder live in 67 other localities throughout the country.

The kiosks are the primary source of getting online for many students. It is the existence of this network of kiosks that led to the creation of the distance-learning program as a viable means to reach students over the Internet.

TECSUP's Internet courses generally last seven weeks. Students are able to read course materials, perform self-evaluations, participate in debates with other students, and communicate with the teacher through the Internet. Students pace themselves and study at any time, but they are required to take a final exam in person at a specified TECSUP testing center. The teaching staff take part in a continual training program on virtual teaching methodologies in order to respond more effectively to the needs of online students.

Although TECSUP Virtual has grown in tandem with the rapid expansion of Internet access in Peru, it is very far from meeting the full demand for in-service training of workers. To help finance ongoing expansion of online programs, the IDB's Multilateral Investment Fund last year approved a \$1 million grant for TECSUP. With these resources, TECSUP Virtual expects to enroll an additional 7,900 technical workers and 840 students pursuing technical degrees in the next three years.

Summary Data:

- *Training converted to e-learning:* Students were previously trained through traditional classroom work. The existence of the online version of already developed courses has raised the number of total participants in the program rather than taking students away from the traditional program.
- *Target audience:* The primary target audiences are college-age students with a high school diploma. The school is also developing programs for less-educated students and individuals seeking new or additional training.
- *Training practices prior to e-learning:* TECSUP offered roughly a dozen courses on similar topics for more than 500 students enrolled in the university.
- *Purpose of training conversion:* The university wanted to be able to expand its reach to students who would not otherwise have the opportunity to attend courses.
- *Results of programmatic change:* Ten percent of the school's existing students are online, and since instituting the online program, traditional classroom enrollment has increased 5 percent.

ANNEX C

Advantages and Disadvantages of Nine Basic Needs Assessment Techniques

Observation	Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Can be as technical as time-motion studies or as functionally or behaviorally specific as observing a new board or staff member interacting during a meeting. ▪ May be as unstructured as walking through an agency's offices on the lookout for evidence of communication barriers. ▪ Can be used normatively to distinguish between effective and ineffective behaviors, organizational structures, or process. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Minimizes interruption of routine workflow or group activity. ▪ Generates <i>in situ</i> data, highly relevant to the situation where response to identified training needs/interests will have an impact. ▪ When combined with feedback step, provides for important comparison checks between inferences of the observer and the respondent. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Requires a highly skilled observer with both process and content knowledge (unlike an interviewer who needs, for the most part, only process skills). ▪ Carries limitations that derive from being able to collect data only within the work setting (the other side of the first advantage listed in the preceding column). ▪ Holds potential for respondents to perceive the observation activity as "spying."
Questionnaires	Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ May be in the form of surveys or polls of a random or stratified sample of respondents, or an enumeration of an entire "population." ▪ Can use a variety of question formats: open-ended, projective, forced-choice, priority-ranking. ▪ Can take alternative forms such as Q-sorts, slip-sorts, or rating scales, either pre-designed or self-generated by the respondent(s). ▪ May be self-administered (by mail) under controlled or uncontrolled conditions, or may require the presence of an interpreter or assistant. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Can reach a large number of people in a short time. ▪ Are relatively inexpensive. ▪ Give opportunity of expression without fear of embarrassment. ▪ Yield data easily summarized and reported. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Make little provision for free expression of unanticipated responses. ▪ Require substantial time (and technical skills, especially in survey model) for development of effective instruments. ▪ Are of limited utility in getting at causes of problems or possible solution. ▪ Suffer low return rates (mailed), drudging responses, or unintended or inappropriate responses.

Key Consultation	Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Secures information from persons who, by virtue of their formal or informal standing, are in a good position to know what the training needs of a particular group are: board chairperson, related service providers, members of professional associations, individuals from the service population. ▪ Once identified, data can be gathered from these consultants using techniques such as interviews, group discussion, and questionnaires. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Is relatively simple and inexpensive to conduct. ▪ Permits input and interaction of a number of individuals, each with his or her own perspectives of the needs of the area, discipline, group, etc. ▪ Establishes and strengthens lines of communication between participants in the process. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Carries built-in bias, since it is based on views of those who tend to see training needs from their own individual or organizational perspective. ▪ May result in only a partial picture of training needs due to the typically non-representative nature (in a statistical sense) of a key informant group.
Print Media	Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Can include professional journals, legislative news/notes, industry "rags," trade magazines, in-house publications. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Is an excellent source of information for uncovering and clarifying normative needs. ▪ Provides information that is current, if not forward-looking. ▪ Is readily available and is apt to have already been reviewed by the client group. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Can be a problem when it comes to the data analysis and synthesis into a usable form (use of clipping service of key consultants can make this type of data more usable).
Interviews	Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Can be formal or casual, structured or unstructured, or somewhere in between. ▪ May be used with a sample of a particular group (board, staff, committee) or conducted with everyone concerned. ▪ Can be done in person, by phone, at the work site, or away from it. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Are adept at revealing feelings, causes of and possible solutions to problems that clients are facing (or anticipate). ▪ Provide maximum opportunity for clients to represent themselves spontaneously on their own terms (especially when conducted in an open-ended, non-directive manner). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Are usually time consuming. ▪ Can produce data that are difficult to analyze and quantify (especially from unstructured formats). ▪ Unless the interviewer is skilled the client(s) can easily be made to feel self-conscious. ▪ Rely for success on a skillful interviewer who can generate data without making client(s) feel self-conscious, suspicious, etc.

Group Discussion	Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Resembles face-to-face interview technique, e.g., structured or unstructured, formal or informal, or somewhere in between. ▪ Can be focused on job (role) analysis, group problem analysis, group goal setting, or any number of group tasks or themes, e.g. "leadership training needs of the board." ▪ Uses one or several of the familiar group facilitating techniques: brainstorming, nominal group process, force-fields, consensus rankings, organizational mirroring, simulation, and sculpting. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Permits on-the-spot synthesis of different viewpoints. ▪ Builds support for the particular service response that is ultimately decided on. ▪ Decreases client's "dependence response" toward the service provider since data analysis is (or can be) a shared function. ▪ Helps participants to become better problem analysts, better listeners, etc. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Is time consuming (therefore initially expensive) both for the consultant and the agency. ▪ Can produce data that are difficult to synthesize and quantify (more a problem with the less structured techniques).
Tests	Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Are a hybridized form of questionnaire. ▪ Can be very functionally oriented (like observations) to test a board, staff, or committee member's proficiency. ▪ May be used to sample learned ideas and facts. ▪ Can be administered with or without the presence of an assistant. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Can be especially helpful in determining whether the cause of a recognized problem is a deficiency in knowledge or skill or, by elimination, attitude. ▪ Results are easily quantifiable and comparable. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ The availability of a relatively small number of tests that are validated for a specific situation. ▪ Do not indicate if measured knowledge and skills are actually being used in the on-the-job or "back home group" situation.
Records, Reports	Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Can consist of organizational charts, planning documents, policy manuals, audits, and budget reports. ▪ Include employee records (grievance, turnover, accidents, etc.) ▪ Include minutes of meetings, weekly, monthly program reports, memoranda, agency service records, and program evaluation studies. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Provide excellent clues to trouble spots. ▪ Provide objective evidence of the results of problems within the agency or group. ▪ Can be collected with a minimum of effort and interruption of workflow since they already exist at the work site. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Often do not show causes of problems or possible solutions. ▪ Carry perspective that generally reflects the past situation rather than the current one (or recent changes). ▪ Need a skilled data analyst if clear patterns and trends are to emerge from such technical and diffuse raw data.

Work Samples	Advantages	Disadvantages
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Are similar to observation but in written form. ▪ Can be products generated in the course of the organization's work, e.g., ad layouts, program proposals, market analyses, letters, training designs. ▪ Written responses to a hypothetical but relevant case study provided by the consultant. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Carry most of the advantages of record and reports data. ▪ Are the organization's data (their own output). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Need specialized content analysts. ▪ Analysts' assessment of strengths/weaknesses disclosed by samples can be challenged as "too subjective."

Source: Silberman, Mel. *Active Training*. Jossey-Bass, Inc. 1990. pp. 16-19.

Annex 7: Quarterly Financial Summary